The Hinxton Group

An International Consortium on Stem Cells, Ethics and Law

Consensus Statement
February 24, 2006

Stem cell and related research holds out immense promise for good. This research has the potential to dramatically increase our understanding of human biology from which may come new treatments for many serious diseases and injuries. The moral reason to conduct stem cell and nuclear reprogramming research thus comes from both the possibility of advancing knowledge and the values of relieving suffering and promoting human welfare. Furthermore, intra- and international scientific collaboration are vital to the success and advancement of science.

While we strive for consensus on a fundamental ethical framework for stem cell research, we acknowledge the reality of cultural diversity and moral disagreement about some elements of stem cell research. Inconsistent and conflicting laws prevent some scientists from engaging in this research and hinder global collaboration. Societies have the authority to regulate science, and scientists have a responsibility to obey the law. However, policy makers should refrain from interfering with the freedom of citizens unless good and sufficient justification can be produced for so doing. As scientists, philosophers, bioethicists, lawyers, clinicians, journal editors and regulators involved in this field, we have reached consensus that if humankind is to have the very best chance of realizing the benefits of stem cell research in an ethically acceptable manner, the following principles should guide the ethical and legal regulation and oversight of stem cell and related research and its clinical applications. This is by no means a comprehensive list of principles, but rather a declaration of those discussed and agreed upon by our group:

1. Stem cell research should seek to minimize harm, and any risk of harm should be commensurate with expected overall benefit. Scientists and clinicians should conduct research according to ethically acceptable norms. For example, research should be conducted so as to protect the well-being, liberty and rights of cell and tissue donors as well as research participants. Research participants and donors of human materials must provide valid informed consent, and conflicts of interest should be appropriately addressed.

2. The law carries great power to facilitate or restrict scientific exploration in the area of stem cell research. Law makers should be circumspect when regulating science. When enacted, laws or regulations governing science nationally and internationally ought to be flexible, so as to accommodate rapid scientific advance.

3. Scientists and clinicians have a responsibility to obey the law. However, they also have the right to know through clear and explicit laws, what is and is not permitted with
respect to their research, the jurisdiction of any prohibitions, and related penalties, so that they can regulate their behavior accordingly.

4. In countries with laws that restrict elements of human embryonic stem cell (hESC) research but that do not expressly prohibit international collaborations, research institutions should neither discriminate against nor restrict the freedom of their investigators who want to travel to do work that is undertaken with scientific and ethical integrity.

5. Law makers should be similarly circumspect in restricting citizens' conduct extraterritorially with regard to stem cell research. So long as scientifically and ethically defensible hESC research is undertaken in a country in which it is legally permissible, scientists should be free to participate in that research without fear of being liable to prosecution, restriction, or discrimination in another jurisdiction.

6. It is essential that scientists and policy makers consult each other and the public in the attempt to develop regulatory regimes for stem cell research that strike the best possible balance between free scientific inquiry and social values.

7. Journal editors should encourage authors to include in manuscripts explicit descriptions of their roles in the published research so as to clarify the appropriateness of their participation, in particular for researchers residing in countries with more restrictive laws and collaborating with researchers residing in countries with more permissive laws.

In addition, we reached consensus on the following forward-looking strategies to foster the scientific and ethical integrity of research in a global context:

8. Insofar as ESC lines are a precious resource and replication and scientific collaboration are vital to scientific advancement, we encourage scientists conducting stem cell research to submit any stem cell lines they derive to national or international depositories that subscribe to internationally accepted standards of quality and make cell lines and data (e.g. DNA fingerprinting and microsatellite data) publicly available.

9. Journal editors should support and promote high standards for scientific peer review. For studies generating new ESC lines described in manuscripts submitted for publication, we encourage journal editors to require that authors submit data verifying the authenticity of the ESC lines, and an explanation of how the authors have complied with accepted standards of good cell culture practice. We further urge journal editors to require that the source of the cells used in the research be clearly specified.

10. Journal editors should also support and promote high standards for ethical integrity in stem cell science. Journal editors should require a statement from scientists that their research conforms to local laws and policies, and that, where applicable, it has been approved by all appropriate oversight committees. Authors should provide statements of all conflicts of interest that affect their research. On request from editors, authors should provide protocols approved by ethics review committees, consent forms, information
provided to potential human subjects and tissue donors, and other related documents or information that may bear on the ethics of the research.

11. For the purposes of oversight, regulations and applications to ethics review boards and funding agencies, etc., human materials donors in the context of human ESC research ought to be treated as human research subjects.

12. We encourage the creation of a public database for the deposition of statements of ethical conduct and guidance, research protocols, consent forms, information provided to potential human subjects and tissue donors and other related documents that bear on the ethics of stem cell research.

13. As the science evolves, academies of science and relevant professional organizations, in consultation with the public, should continue to develop guidelines for the ethical conduct of stem cell research and clinical trials. Insofar as possible, these guidelines should be applicable to stem cell research internationally and should continue to address the challenges of international collaboration.

14. Funding bodies must take adequate steps to satisfy themselves that those they fund intend to carry out their research ethically and in accordance with relevant national regulations and appropriate international guidance as it emerges.

15. Research institutions and laboratories are encouraged to provide opportunity for researchers to engage in ethical discussion, review, and education.

While we believe we have accomplished much, we believe there is much work to be done. For example:

16. Insofar as donors of human materials are treated as human subjects, many of the ethical issues raised by hESC research can be adequately addressed through existing international codes of ethics and policy documents governing research involving human subjects. However, new ethical challenges in the conduct of stem cell research that are on the horizon cannot be adequately addressed by existing international ethical codes or practices. Examples are gametes derived from hESC, and human-non human chimeras. At least one national effort is currently underway to anticipate such challenges. However, it is imperative that international efforts to address these new issues be initiated as soon as possible in order to ensure that science proceeds in an ethically acceptable fashion and to reduce the likelihood that diversity in international response will result in obstacles to ethical conduct similar to those raised by existing differences in national policies governing hESC research and nuclear transfer.

17. Steps should be taken to develop consensus in ethical standards and practices in hESC research for international collaboration to proceed with confidence and for research from anywhere in the world that adheres to these standards and practices to be accepted as valid and valuable by the scientific community and academic journals.
18. To achieve this goal, it will be necessary to specify what these standards and practices should be through the international efforts of scientists, philosophers, bioethicists, lawyers, clinicians, journal editors and regulators involved in this field, in collaboration and consultation with the public. It is imperative that scientists in particular actively and honestly engage with the public about the promises and limitations of this research.

19. This process of identification of international ethical standards and practices should include concerted efforts to engage people throughout the world in honest and realistic conversations about the science and ethics of stem cell research and its emerging applications.
Steering Committee

Peter J. Donovan, Ph.D.
Professor, Biological Chemistry,
Developmental & Cell Biology, University of California - Irvine
2054 Hewitt Hall
Irvine, CA 92697
Phone: 949 824 3691
Fax: 949 824 6388
Email: pdonovan@uci.edu

Ruth Faden, Ph.D., M.P.H.
Philip Franklin Wagley Professor of Biomedical Ethics,
Director, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute,
The Johns Hopkins University
624 North Broadway, Room 352
Baltimore, MD 21205-1996
Phone: 410 955 3018
Fax: 410 614 9567
Email: rafaden@jhsphs.edu

Sir David Alliance Professor of Bioethics, Institute of Medicine Law and Bioethics,
School of Law, University of Manchester
Oxford Road
Manchester M13 9PL
Phone: +44 161 275 3473
Fax: +44 161 275 7704
Email: john.harris@manchester.ac.uk

Robin Lovell-Badge, Ph.D., F. Med. Sc., F. R. S.
Head, Division of Developmental Genetics, MRC National Institute for Medical Research
Division of Developmental Genetics, MRC National Institute for Medical Research
The Ridgeway, Mill Hill, London NW7 1AA, UH
Phone: +44 020 8816 2126
Email: rlovell@nimr.mrc.ac.uk

Debra J.H. Mathews, Ph.D., M.A.
Assistant Director for Science Programs, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute,
The Johns Hopkins University
100 North Charles Street, Suite 740
Baltimore, MD 21201
Phone: 410 516 8602
Fax: 410 516 8504
Email: dmathews@jhmi.edu

Julian Savulescu, B. Med. Sc., M.B., B.S., M.A., Ph.D.
Uehiro Chair in Practical Ethics,
Director, Program on the Ethics of the New Biosciences,
21st Century School, University of Oxford,
Littlegate House, St Ebbe
Oxford OX1 1F, UK
Phone: +44 1865 286888
Fax: +44 1865 286886
Email: julian.suvulescu@philosophy.ox.ac.uk

Other Members

Jayapaul Azariah, M.A., M.Sc., Ph.D.
Professor and Head (Retired), Department of Zoology,
Director, School of Life Sciences (Retired), University of Madras,
Founder & President, All India Bioethics Association

Nissim Benvenisty M.D., Ph.D.
Professor of Genetics, The Herbert Cohn Chair in Cancer Research,
Director, Stem Cell Unit, Department of Genetics,
Institute of Life Sciences, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem

Hilary Bok, Ph.D.
Henry R. Luce Professor of Bioethics and Moral & Political Theory,
The Johns Hopkins University School of Arts & Sciences

Silvia Brunelli, Ph.D.
Senior Researcher, Stem Cell Research Institute, DIBIT-HSR
Assistant Professor of Genetics and Biology,
Department of Experimental, Environmental Medicine and Medical Biotechnology, University of Milano-Bicocca

Philip Campbell, Ph.D.
Editor-in-Chief, Nature

Sarah Chan, B.Sc.(Hons), L.L.B
Research Fellow, Centre for Social Ethics and Policy,
University of Manchester

Linhao Cheng, Ph.D.
Associate Professor, Stem Cell Program, Institute for Cell Engineering,
The Johns Hopkins University School of Medicine

David Coles, Ph.D., B.Sc.

Katrien Devolder, Ph.D.
Research Fellow, Centre for Environmental Philosophy and Bioethics,
Ghent University

Julia Finkel, B.A.
Research Assistant, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute,
The Johns Hopkins University

Minou Friele (Ph.D. Candidate)
Heinrich-Heine University, Düsseldorf

David Heyd, Ph.D., B.Sc.
Chaim Perelman Chair in Philosophy,
Department of Philosophy, The Hebrew University

Rev. Colin Honey, M.A.
Director, Lonsdale Centre for Applied Ethics
Insoo Hyun, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor, Department of Bioethics,
Case Western Reserve University School of Medicine

Rosario M. Isasi, J.D., M.P.H.
Postdoctoral Fellow, Genetics & Society Project,
Centre de recherche en droit public, Université de Montréal

Kyu Won, Jung, M.D., Ph.D.
Assistant Professor of Law, Hanyang University

S. Matthew Liao, D.Phil.
Greenwall Fellow 2004-2006,
The Johns Hopkins and Georgetown Universities

Anne McLaren, D.B.E., F.R.S.
Distinguished Group Leader,
Wellcome Trust/Cancer Research UK,
Gurdon Institute

Maurizio Mori, M.A., Ph.D.
Professor, Department of Philosophy,
University of Turin

Christian Munithe, Ph.D.
Professor of Practical Philosophy,
Department of Philosophy, Göteborg University

Alison Murdoch, B.Sc., M.D., F.R.C.O.G.
Head, Newcastle Fertility Centre,
BioScience Centre, International Centre for Life

Norio Nakatsuji, D.Sc.
Director and Professor, Institute for Frontier Medical Sciences,
Kyoto University

Chris O’Toole, Ph.D.
Head of Research Regulation,
Human Fertilisation & Embryology Authority

Mitradas M. Panicker, Ph.D.
Associate Professor,
National Centre for Biological Sciences (TIFR)

Mark Patterson, Ph.D.
Director of Publishing, Public Library of Science

Roger A. Pedersen, Ph.D.
Professor of Regenerative Medicine,
University of Cambridge

Martin Frederick Pera, B.A., Ph.D., M.A.
Research Professor, Monash Institute of Medical Research, Monash University,
Director of Embryonic Stem Cell Research, Australian Stem Cell Centre, Monash Institute of Medical Research,
Beverly A. Parnell, Ph.D.
Senior Editor, Science Magazine
American Association for Advancement of Science

Alan Regenber, M.B.E.
Senior Research Program Coordinator, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute,
The Johns Hopkins University

Ren-Zong Qio, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor of Bioethics, Institute of Philosophy, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences,
Professor and Director, Center for Bioethics, Central China University of Science and Technology,
Professor, Research Center for Bioethics, Peking Union Medical College

Carlos M. Romeo-Casabona, Dr. iur. Dr. med. Dr. h.c.mult.
Professor in Criminal Law, Director, Inter-University Chair,
BBVA Foundation - Provincial Government of Biscay in Law and the Human Genome
University of Deusto / University of The Basque Country

Brian Salter, B.A., M.A., Ph.D.
Professor of Biopolitics, Global Biopolitics Research Group,
University of East Anglia

Taylor Samucston
Public Affairs Team,
British Embassy, Washington

Josep Santaló, Ph.D.
Associate Professor on Cell Biology, Departament de Biologia Cellular, Facultat de Ciències,
Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona

Rhodri Saunders (M.Bioch. Candidate)
Hertford College

Hui Z. Sheng, M.D., Ph.D.
Professor and Head, Center for Developmental Biology,
Xinhua Hospital, Shanghai Jiao Tong University

Loane Skene, L.L.M. (Mon), L.L.B. (Hons) (Melb)
Professor of Law, Faculty of Law,
Faculty of Medicine, Dentistry and Health Sciences
University of Melbourne

Davor Solter, M.D., Ph.D.
Department of Developmental Biology,
Director, Max-Planck Institute of Immunobiology

Glyn Stacey, Ph.D.
Head of Division of Cell Biology and Imaging,
National Institute for Biological Standards and Control
Director, The UK Stem Cell Bank

William C. Stuhling
President, The Greenwall Foundation
Jeremy Sugarman, M.D., M.P.H., M.A.
Harvey M. Meyerhoff Professor of Bioethics and Medicine,
Deputy Director for Medicine, The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute,
The Johns Hopkins University

Andrew M. Sagduu, Ph.D.
International Managing Editor, Science International
American Association for the Advancement of Science

André Van Steirteghem, M.D., Ph.D.
Scientific and Laboratory Director, Clinical Centre for Reproductive Medicine and the Research Centre for Reproduction and Genetics of the Dutch-speaking Brussels Free University, Past-Dean of the Faculty of Medicine and Pharmacy, Past-Chairman and Executive Director of the European Society of Human Reproduction and Embryology, Deputy Editor, Human Reproduction

Susan E. Wallace, Ph.D., M.A.
Policy Officer (Humanities), Public Health Genetics Unit, Cambridge Genomics Knowledge Park

Leroy B. Walters, Ph.D.
Professor, Philosophy Department, Georgetown University

Elias T. Zambidis M.D./Ph.D.
Assistant Professor in Pediatrics and Oncology, Sidney Kimmel Comprehensive Cancer Center at John Hopkins

Funded By:
The Greenwall Foundation
The Wellcome Trust
The British Embassy, Washington
The Juvenile Diabetes Research Foundation
The Phoebe R. Berman Bioethics Institute, Johns Hopkins University
The James Martin 21st Century School, University of Oxford

The consensus statement from the Hinxton Group will be available at
www.hopkinsmedicine.org/bioethics

1 Uncorrected advance copy
3 The Human Fertilisation and Embryology Authority (HFEA) is conducting at least one national effort to anticipate to these challenges.