SETTING FIRE TO OUR BED:
A LOOK AT NARRATIVE PERSUASION THROUGH INVESTIGATING DEPICTIONS OF INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE

Desirae Sarah Masterson

Submitted to the faculty of the University Graduate School in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts in the Department of Communication Studies. Indiana University September 2015
Accepted by the Graduate Faculty, Indiana University, in partial
fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Master's Thesis Committee

________________________________________
Ronald Sandwina, Ph. D., Chair

________________________________________
Nancy Rhodes, Ph.D.

________________________________________
Catherine A. Dobris, Ph.D.

________________________________________
Kim White-Mills, Ph.D.
DEDICATION

This thesis and degree are dedicated to:

Ray Masterson

I love you. Thank you for supporting this dream. My hope is that it pays off for all of us.
Your sacrifice and support are appreciated.

Carter Masterson & Wyatt Masterson

Carter and Wyatt, you have no idea what is like to have a Mommy who is not in school. I
hope that this journey has taught you that value of education and the necessity to never stop
learning. I love you.

The Computers that have sacrificed for this advanced degree

To the three computers that have fallen in the line of duty for this master’s degree, your
sacrifice has not gone unnoticed. And to the fourth computer which was wounded during
writing of the final version of this thesis. Hold on. Please, just…hold on…
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This degree and thesis would not be possible without the support, guidance and/or patience of many people. First, I would like to thank the faculty and staff of the Department of Communication Studies. Without your guidance I would not have my bachelor’s degree, let alone my master’s.

Stephen Lebeau: Thank you for support and encouragement during both my undergrad and graduate studies.

Hailey Aycock: Without your help I would not have been able to run all of my IUPUI participants in one summer.

Kuo Li: Your work and friendship are both truly treasured by me. Thank you for helping with my participants.

Pat at the writing center: Last summer you have been my daily and weekly reader. You kept me on track and served as my own, very own, cheerleader. Thank you.

Joy Knight: You are an editing Maven and the best cheerleader in the world.

Kim White-Mills: Thank you for all of your help with my participant gathering, managing Hailey’s independent study, and with your help running my research lab.

Catherine Dobris: Thank you for your guidance through Chapter Two. The semester I took your class was life changing for me, and it played a large role in my academic transformation. Thank you again. You have made me a better writer.

Nancy Rhodes: Wow, I do not know where to begin with my gratitude. Thank you for introducing me and taking me to the dark side, i.e., experimental research. This has been a very long road. Thank you for traveling it with me.
Ron Sandwina: Without you I would not be here. I could fill a book with the 167 or so reasons you helped me get here. Starting in 2002, it is when you strongly suggested that I just major in Communication because I was already taking all the classes anyway.

Mom and Dad: You both showed me it was possible to get a master’s degree with kids. Thank you for all you have done.

Grams: I cannot begin to thank you. You have dedicated that last four years to my family. Thank you. Thank you for your support while I have chased this dream.
Desirae Sarah Masterson

SETTING FIRE TO OUR BED:
A LOOK AT NARRATIVE PERSUASION THROUGH
INVESTIGATING DEPICTIONS OF INTIMATE PARTNER VIOLENCE

This thesis sought to attain a greater understanding of persuasion through narrative. First, a rhetorical analysis was conducted. The rhetorical analysis identified fantasy themes represented in two original music video artifacts. These themes formed what the author calls Symbolic Convergence Cycle of Intimate Partner Violence (IPV). Next, an experiment was conducted to provide further evidence that realistic narrative presentations have a greater ability to shape perceptions than more abstract presentations. Findings included that women were more likely to identify subtle abusive behaviors as abusive than men. However, after exposure to conditions containing the visual portion of the music video “Love the Way You Lie”, both female and male participants were less likely to identify subtle abusive behavior as abusive. This revealed that even though two messages can contain the same themes about the subject of IPV, the way that these messages were presented effected the way in which viewers interpreted the messages.

Ronald Sandwina, Ph. D., Chair
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER ONE - INTRODUCTION TO THE STUDY .................................................. 1

Introduction to Intimate Partner Violence ................................................................. 1

Intimate Partner Violence and the Media ................................................................. 2

Thesis Structure and Theoretical Basis ...................................................................... 4

   Cultivation Theory .................................................................................................. 5

   Transportation ........................................................................................................ 5

   Entertainment-Education ....................................................................................... 6

Rational for the Study ............................................................................................... 6

CHAPTER TWO - A CRITICAL INTRODUCTION OF THE ARTIFACTS ... 7

Artifacts ..................................................................................................................... 8

   “Love the Way You Lie” ....................................................................................... 8

   “Kiss with a Fist” ............................................................................................ 12

Presentation and Justification for the Implementation of Symbolic Convergence Theory ... 14

   Fantasy Theme Analysis ..................................................................................... 14

Symbolic Convergence Theory .............................................................................. 15

   Rhetorical vision ................................................................................................. 18

   Fantasy theme ................................................................................................. 18

   Symbolic cues ................................................................................................. 19

   Dramatis personae .......................................................................................... 19

   Plotline ............................................................................................................ 19

   Scene .............................................................................................................. 19
Fantasy theme artistry ............................................................................................................................ 19

Symbolic Convergence Cycle Analysis of the Artifacts ...........................................................................20

“Love the Way You Lie .......................................................................................................................... 20

Fantasy Themes of Love, Passion, and Violence through the Gothic Lens ..................................................21

Scene ................................................................................................................................................... 21

Dramatis personae ...................................................................................................................................22

Plotline .................................................................................................................................................... 26

Gothic fantasy theme artistry ..................................................................................................................27

“Kiss With a Fist” .................................................................................................................................... 27

Fantasy Theme Artistry .......................................................................................................................... 27

Scene ................................................................................................................................................... 28

Dramatis personae ...................................................................................................................................29

Plotline .................................................................................................................................................... 30

Rhetorical Vision and Fantasy Themes .....................................................................................................31

The Symbiotic Convergence Cycle of Intimate Partner Violence ............................................................32

CHAPTER THREE – LITERATURE REVIEW ..........................................................................................36

Music Video in the Modern Era ..............................................................................................................36

Music Video and Music Genre .................................................................................................................38

Music Video and Content Analysis ..........................................................................................................38

Interpretation research ............................................................................................................................40

Effects research .....................................................................................................................................41

Punk .......................................................................................................................................................43

Hip-Hop ..................................................................................................................................................45

Modes of Inquiry and Ways of Understanding .........................................................................................48
Cultivation Theory .............................................................................................................. 48
Transportation ..................................................................................................................... 49
Cultivation and Transportation .......................................................................................... 52
Entertainment-Education ................................................................................................... 54
Conclusion .......................................................................................................................... 56
Hypotheses and Research Questions .................................................................................. 58

CHAPTER FOUR – METHOD ............................................................................................... 59
Participants .......................................................................................................................... 59
Research Design and Stimuli ............................................................................................... 60
Procedure ............................................................................................................................ 61
Measures .............................................................................................................................. 62
Transportation .................................................................................................................... 62
Message Enjoyment ........................................................................................................... 62
Definition Measure ............................................................................................................ 62
Experience Measure .......................................................................................................... 63
Demographic Data Collection ........................................................................................... 63

CHAPTER FIVE – RESULTS ............................................................................................... 64
Experience with IPV ............................................................................................................ 64
Sex Differences in Perceptions and Effects ....................................................................... 64
Stimulus Effects .................................................................................................................. 65
Sex Differences in Enjoyment and Transportation ............................................................ 67
Enjoyment and Transportation as Mediators of Perceptions of IPV .................................. 67

CHAPTER SIX – DISCUSSION ........................................................................................... 67
Summary of Results and Implications ............................................................................... 69
Chapter One
Introduction to the Study

Introduction to Intimate Partner Violence

The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) reported in the 2010 “National Intimate Partner and Sexual Violence Survey” (NISVS) that one in four women and one in seven men have been the victim of severe physical violence by an intimate partner. Intimate partner violence (IPV), also known as domestic violence, is defined by the CDC as: “physical, sexual, or psychological harm by a current or former partner or spouse” (IPV: Definitions, CDC, 2014, para. 1). Couples who do not share sexual intimacy can still experience IPV. Both heterosexual and same-sex relationships may include IPV. IPV occurs on a continuum which ranges from “one hit that may or may not impact the victim to chronic, severe battering” (IPV: Definitions, CDC, 2014, par. 20). IPV does not discriminate by race, religion, or socioeconomic status. NISVS reported that in the United States, approximately 24 people per minute are victims of physical violence, rape, or stalking by an intimate partner (Jane Doe Inc., 2014).

The academic community, the medical community, and policy makers have explored, discussed, and written about IPV for decades. Those writing with a scholarly focus on topics including the geneses of violence within a relationship, how IPV is treated by the media, and societal attitudes about IPV. The medical community looks at ways to identify relationships that are high risk and ways to intervene to prevent future harm or death to the members of the families affected by physical, mental, or emotional abuse (Basile, Hertz, and Back, 2007). Policymakers have studied couples who participate in relationships that involve IPV as well as the ways institutions deal with it (NISVS, 2010).
Intimate Partner Violence and the Media

Some within the entertainment community address the problem of IPV head-on. For instance, actors Mariska Hargitay and Peter Hermann started the Joyful Heart Foundation as a response to the fan mail Hargitay received while portraying Detective Olivia Benson on the television program Law and Order SVU (1990-). Hargitay was shocked and heartbroken to find that the women who wrote her shared experiences that were worse than the fictionalized portrayals of the program in which she starred (Katie Couric Show, 2013).

One of the issues that the foundation addresses is domestic violence. “This is an epidemic that is afflicting our society,” said Hargitay about domestic violence in an interview on the Katie Couric Show (2013). In May of 2014, the Joyful Heart foundation and Viacom joined to produce a second round of “No More” Public Service Announcements (PSAs) to address the subject of IPV, as well as other violent crimes that affect women and children. A third round of “No More” PSAs were released in conjunction with the National Football League (NFL) in December of 2014. The Joyful Heart Foundation continues to utilize celebrities to bring attention to IPV.

IPV messages are directly and indirectly relayed through various forms of entertainment mediums beyond PSAs. For instance, many films have used IPV as the central theme of plots (Lenahan, 2009). Several lists are available on the internet which provide Hollywood film renderings of domestic violence (Selected movies, 2014; Films with a domestic violence theme, n.d.; 6 Domestic Violence, 2010). IPV is presented in fictional portrayals such as Sleeping with the Enemy (1991) or presented in a biopic such as What's Love Got to Do with It? (1993).

IPV is also featured in both fictional and nonfiction television programs such as Law and Order SVU (1999-), Dr. Phil (2002-), Criminal Minds (2005-), Glee (2009-), and The
Walking Dead (2010- ). Additionally, local news outlets will occasionally report human interest stories about homes that shelter victims of domestic violence. National news magazine programs tell stories about unsolved murders involving IPV or uplifting pieces about women who have survived or have been permanently damaged by IPV. Many of these IPV-related stories have been investigated in various ways to determine what messages are being relayed to the public about IPV.

Critics and advocacy groups do not always agree about what messages viewers are receiving about the IPV situations presented on television, and this argument does not end within the realm of televised and filmed messages. The topic of IPV is also addressed in most genres of music. Several lists of performances that romanticize or decry IPV are currently available online. Songfacts’, “Songs that Deal with Child Abuse or Domestic Violence”; Audio Visual Club’s (A.V. Club’s), “The Hits Keep Coming: 30 Songs Inspired by Domestic Violence”; and Black Entertainment Television’s (BET’s), “Songs That Take a Stand Against Domestic Violence” are just a few examples of these lists. Interestingly, these lists do not always agree on which songs glamorize IPV and which songs stand against it. For example, BET considers Eminem’s hip-hop song, “Love the Way You Lie” (“Lie”), featuring Rihanna, anti-IPV; meanwhile A.V. Club’s list includes it as a song that promotes IPV.

All of these communication channels (i.e., music, film, television, and the internet) define and shape societal perceptions of IPV. Some of these channels may exist to entertain; however, they educate viewers and listeners as well. These channels, at times, reinforce societal beliefs about IPV, introduce new descriptions of abuse, define what the partners within an abusive situation physically look like, and delineate the roles each of the relationship’s participants.
Messages about IPV are being shared daily across multiple entertainment media channels. Cable, commercial television, satellite television, nonprofit television, satellite radio, commercial radio, nonprofit radio, internet, and film are just a few examples. Messages are also communicated via multiple narrative formats: serial programing, songs, websites, documentaries, miniseries, and commercials to name a few. It is important to determine what messages audiences are receiving about IPV from these channels and narrative formats. Additionally, it is important to ascertain if these messages negatively affect the way people perceive IPV and those who are caught in the cycle of domestic violence. If these messages prove to influence public perceptions about IPV, then the academic, advocacy, and media gate keepers have an obligation to utilize these modes of message transmission to responsibly educate audiences about IPV.

**Thesis Structure and Theoretical Basis**

The following thesis relays the results of a two pronged methodological approach to investigate two music video artifacts: Eminem and Rhianna’s “Lie” and Florence Welch’s “Kiss with a Fist” (“Fist”). The first method, Symbolic Conversion Theory (SCT), is discussed in Chapter Two: “A Rhetorical Criticism.” A second method of investigation is an experiment covered in Chapters Three-Five. All of these methods serve to support and inform each other in this study. Chapter Six will conclude this thesis and discuss the results of these methods and how they connect and expand the understanding of the portrayal of IPV in entertainment media.

This thesis begins with the question of whether the Rhetor’s intended messages are relayed to an audience via a music video. (In the case of this thesis, rhetor refers to the person or persons responsible for creating the mediated message.) The second question addressed within this chapter is, “What are the messages that these videos relay to viewers?”
Within this chapter, Fantasy Theme analysis and Symbolic Convergence Theory (SCT) are used to analyze both “Lie” and “Fist”. SCT, an extension of Fantasy Theme Analysis, emphasizes the role that an audience has with a message relayed in the media. Both Fantasy Theme Analysis and SCT assert that people create realities in which they live through the experiences they share with each other. These realities are supported with shared “truths” or beliefs among people within the collective fantasy. In Chapter Three, the literature review provides a theoretical basis for the experiment, which are presented in Chapters Four and Five. Chapter Three outlines the influence of music videos, the genres of Punk and Hip-Hop, the mode of transportation, Cultivation Theory, and Entertainment Education (EE).

**Cultivation Theory**

Cultivation Theory is one of the most relevant theories used in Communication Inquiry. Cultivation Theory asserts that people’s beliefs about reality and morals are shaped by what they see in media presentations, particularly in television. Some academic inquiry has sought to investigate the relationship between Cultivation Theory and the effect the artifact’s mode of transportation has on the audience.

**Transportation**

One of the purposes of this thesis is to conduct a study that measures the extent to which participants were transported into the “Fist” and “Lie” video artifacts. The mode of transportation (Gerrig, 1993) provides a tool that allows researchers to determine to what extent audiences are drawn into narratives and how these narrative trips influence their attitudes about IPV.
Entertainment-Education

The field of entertainment education provides a foundation for how these messages can be utilized to influence specific audiences about IPV. This thesis acts as a study and takes the first step in the process of decoding current messages.

Rational for this Study

Further understanding of SCT, Cultivation Theory, and the mode of transportation, and how these theories and phenomena work together, will enrich the field of Entertainment Education (EE) by providing a foundation for understanding and creating ethical educational messages. The principles of EE offer a frame to view messages about IPV and a way to utilize the information gathered using the mode of transportation. Moreover, EE is a platform that future ethical educational messages about IPV may be delivered.

This thesis provides analysis and data that will add to the information on what we currently have about the portrayals of IPV. The more we know about how people interpret the media’s depiction of IPV, the more we will know about message interpretation in general. This data and subsequent research can help shape future messages, specifically those messages delivered in an EE format.

This study provides the first step in the exploration of entertainment media messages concerning IPV. It begins with the question of whether the Rhetor’s intended messages are relayed to an audience via a music video. A two pronged mythological approach is applied to two music video artifacts: Eminem and Rhianna’s “Lie” and Florence Welch’s “Fist”. The first method of investigation is a rhetorical criticism (Chapters Two and Six). The second method of investigation is an experiment (Chapters Three-Six). These methods serve to support and inform each other in this study.
Chapter Two
A Critical Introduction of the Artifacts

“Kiss with a Fist”

You hit me once
I hit you back
You gave a kick
I gave a slap
You smashed a plate
Over my head
Then I set fire to our bed (Welch, 2007)
(Complete lyrics available are in Appendix # 1)

“Love the Way You”

Just gonna stand there and watch me burn
But that's alright because I like the way it hurts
Just gonna stand there and hear me cry
But that's alright because I love the way you lie
I love the way you lie
I love the way you lie (Hafferman & Grant n.d.)
(Complete lyrics available are in Appendix # 2)

The lyrics above are the choruses of two songs that have been included in lists of songs concerning domestic violence or intimate partner violence (IPV) (Songfacts’, 2014; A.V. Club, 2014; BET, 2012). The rhetors that originally created these songs did not intend for them to be about IPV. The Hafferman and Grant chorus was co-opted into an Eminem anti-domestic violence rap anthem, “Love the Way You Lie” (“Lie”) (Eminem VEVO, 2010). The Welch chorus belongs to a song titled “Kiss with a Fist” (“Fist”) (Florence and the Machine VEVO, 2009). It may be easy to assume it and its accompanying music video is about domestic violence even though Welch denies this (2008).

In the cases of these rhetorical acts, specifically “Lie”, the amount of control or agency each rhetor had in the creation of the artifact is ambiguous, as other artists contributed their visions to the overall piece, and music industry executives may have had a
say in the message throughout the creation of the artifact. Additionally, the rhetors may not care that their envisioned message was not processed by listeners and viewers the way they originally intended. However, with the growing popularity of EE, it is important to understand effectiveness of given strategies as well as interpretation of those strategies by target audiences in order to increase efficacy of future public education messages. Knowing the impact a message has on an intended audience can be a powerful tool for those involved in creating video messages for education and entertainment venues alike.

Symbolic Convergence Theory (SCT), which is rooted in fantasy theme analysis, provides a tool to investigate these artifacts. Waite (2008) postulated that “fantasy-theme analysis argues that audiences frequently shape their own connotation of an artifact, and this interpretation may vary from the rhetor’s message” (p. 10). In this chapter, I will present the “Lie” music video artifact, summarize the artists’ message intention, and outline the mainstream critical, academic critical, and intended audience responses. Second, I will present the “Fist” music video artifact, summarize the artist’s message intention, and outline the critical and intended audience responses. Next, I will employ SCT to explore to what extent rhetors’ intent has shaped these two artifacts’ messages. I will briefly introduce the fantasy-theme analysis, and then I will describe Bormann’s SCT. Following, I will present the gothic literature motif. Finally, I will employ SCT to discuss the overall rhetorical vision of each artifact.

Artifacts

“Love the Way You Lie”

The performers who released “Lie” consider this song and its accompanying Joseph Kahn-directed music video, a message that condemns IPV (Mathers, M., Grant, A., and Haferman, H. 2010). This song was included in Eminem’s Recovery album, which was
Eminem’s apology to fans for letting his personal issues interfere with his art and thanking them for their continued support (Inkrott, 2013; Enck & McDaniel, 2012). “Lie” was written by Marshall Mathers (also known as Eminem), Alexander Grant (also known as Alex da Kid) and Holly Hafermann (also known as Skylar Grey), and it was produced by Alex da Kid and Makeba Riddick.

A Grey song with the same title provided “Lie’s” bridge. Grey originally wrote the song about her relationship with the music industry. Eminem selected the chorus from Grey’s original demo to deliver a message about a different dysfunctional relationship. Eminem himself has admitted to being involved in a physically, abusive relationship with his ex-wife, Kim Mathers. He paired Grey’s chorus with his own rap lyrics, and recruited Rihanna a performer who was publicly involved in a relationship with Chris Brown that included IPV, to sing the refrain.

This vocal performance was paired with a cinematic quality music video that featured two actors, Megan Fox and Dominic Monaghan. While Fox and Monaghan portray the couple presented in the song, Rihanna and Eminem are separated from the action of the song. Throughout the video, Eminem is filmed in a field sharing an in-depth story from the male partner’s point of view, while Rihanna is filmed in front of a burning home that protagonists share. She sings the chorus from what is presumably the female point-of-view in a heterosexual relationship that involves the destructive Cycle of Violence.

Rihanna, in an interview with a television entertainment magazine program, Access Hollywood, elaborated on the importance and meaning of the song for herself:

It's something that, you know, [Eminem and I have] both experienced, you know, on different sides, different ends of the table…It just was authentic. It was real. It was believable for us to do a record like that, but it was also something that needed to be done and the way he did it was so clever. He pretty much just broke down the cycle of domestic violence and it's
something that a lot of people don't have a lot of insight on, so this song is a really, really powerful song and it touches a lot of people (Access Hollywood, n.d.).

It appears that Rihanna chose to take part in this performance because she believed that by shedding light on the cycle of violence that she was speaking out against IPV. However, the song provided a fairly limited role for Rihanna. The role of singing the reframe does not allow the singer to expand on a message. In this role Rihanna cannot give as detailed a message as Eminem, who raps all of the song’s verses.

Since its release, “Lie” has known considerable popular success. To date, “Lie” has been included on 21 different charts worldwide for 701 weeks (Acharts, 2014). In his “Bottom Line,” Bill Lamb (2010) of About.com provided high praise for Eminem, “Few major recording artists can truly send chills up the spine when you listen to their words, and Eminem has that gift” (para. 1). He continued praising, “Lie,” “Eminem's spitting, frustrated words are the additional piece which results in a truly brilliant, epic song of pain, regret, violence, and a failing struggle for redemption” (para. 3). Lamb was not alone in his praise.

The day following “Lie’s” music video release, Rochelle Thomas of Music Television (MTV) reported in an article (2010), “Less than 24 hours after MTV debuted the video for Eminem's chart-topping single about the evolution of his relationship with his ex-wife, Kim, many are wondering: Does ‘Love the Way You Lie’ glamorize domestic violence?” Thomas inferred that this was not the case. She supported her claim with a quote from an expert on domestic violence in her article, Stephanie Nilva, the executive director of a trauma and sexual assault resource center, Day One. In a filmed interview with MTV, Nilva states, “The most important thing the video is doing is raising the topic of dating violence among young
people.” Nilva also noted that the cycle of domestic violence was clearly illustrated in the video (Thomas, 2010).

Though these observations are true, it can be argued that they were rather superficial. Critics, both mainstream and academic, have had concerns about the deeper messages presented in this music video. In an article titled, “Playing with Fire: Cycles of Domestic Violence in Eminem and Rihanna’s ‘Love the Way You Lie’,” authors Enck and McDaniel (2012) asserted “the visual images and narrative combine to serve as a stark reminder that while society at large purports to want to end violence between intimates on the interpersonal level, we continue to romanticize and excuse abusers on the cultural level” (p. 619). Enck and McDaniel employed Conjunctural Critique to analyze this work and concluded that context of both the song and video helped excuse and exonerate both Chris Brown’s and Marshal Mathers’s real-life previous actions as abusers. They explained:

This methodological practice is a venture in articulation which becomes the ‘reconstruction of relations and contexts’ that generate the social formations that comprise the video and surrounding discourses as a cultural conjuncture indicative of broader societal investments regarding domestic violence at the intersections of race, class, and gender (p. 619).

Enck and McDaniel’s analysis provided a critical rebuke of not only Eminem’s rhetoric but of the attitudes held about IPV in the United States. Enck and McDaniel assert that Western culture romanticizes IPV while decrying it.

Some entertainment media critics have come to similar conclusions. Erik Hayden (2010) of The Wire compiled the analysis of other critics in, “Love the Way You Lie: What's Eminem Trying to Say?” Hayden surmised that while the video provided a realistic, emotion packed portrayal that provided awareness, it did not relay a constructive message about domestic violence. During the analysis, I will explore what messages which “Lie” portrays.
“Kiss With a Fist”

In a Punk-like rendition of her song “Kiss with a Fist,” Florence Welch uses lyrics that could be considered harsh and violent. However, Welch asserts that these lyrics are not to be taken literally; rather, Florence Welch wrote the song when she was 17-years-old based on two friends’ relationship. She asserts that they are meant to be a metaphor for a passionate relationship. In a June 7th 2008, MySpace post Florence Welch elaborated:

Kiss with a fist is NOT about domestic violence.
It is about two people pushing each other to psychological extremes because they love each other. The song is not about one person being attacked, or any actual physical violence, there are no victims in this song. Sometimes the love two people have for each other is a destructive force. But they cant [sic] have it any other way, because it's what holds them together, they enjoy the drama and pushing each others [sic] buttons. The only way to express these extreme emotions is with extreme imagery, all of which is fanaticism and nothing in the song is based on reality. Leona lewis's [sic] bleeding love isn't actually about her bleeding. This isn't really about punching someone in the face. Thank you and goodnight. X (Personal communication written on MySpace.com)

The music video that was released by Welch was both visually bright and metaphoric. For example, crate paper and a fan was used in the video to represent fire. This style of presentation appeared to underscore the artist’s claim that this song was not about domestic violence.

“Fist” did not perform as well commercially as “Lie,” which could explain the lack of critical attention that it received. However, “Fist” made two of the same lists of music which addressed IPV as “Lie” (Robinson et al., 2011; Songs that Deal, 2014). In addition, this Indie Rock song was generally mentioned in longer articles that reviewed the album, on which it is included, Lungs.

One academic source, Equinox Online, provided a momentary aside concerning “Fist.” Ann Weatherall in her review book for Language, Gender and Feminism: Theory,
Methodology and Practice briefly discussed “Fist.” She implied that the message of this piece is positive. The author while making an argument against the presentation of postfeminism within the book discusses the message that “Fist” presents, “Popular culture provides positive examples of postfeminism: the song ‘Kiss with a Fist’ by Florence and the Machine (2008) is a postfeminist commentary on women who stay in relationships with violent men” (p. 125). This passing praise within Academia for “Fist” provides an interpretation of the artifact that Welch did not intend, however it does reflect some of the public’s interpretations of the artifact.

“Fist’s” lack of commercial success did not prevent bloggers and forum contributors from discussing it. The site Sociological Images (2010) presented “Kiss with a Fist” and its accompanying music video as an artifact to critique on a forum through a sociological scholarship lens, and 44 participants commented. Members conversed about the messages presented in the text on a much more academic level than other more mainstream discussion boards. Some participants discussed the amount of metaphor Welch used in her work and asserted that metaphors should be read as metaphors.

Other respondents replied in the same tone as napthia9, “Eh, if breaking bones and burning beds is a suitable metaphor for one's turbulent relationship, it might be abusive even if nobody gets hit” (napthia9, personal communication, n.d.). napthia9 and others discussed the images presented with the audio message as well. Some found the music video boring, while others viewed this piece as art. This short catchy song may have used metaphor which could be interpreted as IPV, yet the thoughts and emotions associated with IPV were not fully addressed in this seemly purposely superficial song about a turbulent relationship.

In August of 2012, the YouTube posting of this song included more than 5,000 comments regarding the song’s context. Some posts complimented Welch and the song
while others stated their dislike for it; still other posts argued about whether this song’s theme was about IPV. One commenter, MsSkullkid09, posted, “I can’t decide if I’m supposed to dance or feel deeply disturbed….can I do both?” (personal communication, n.d.). The dichotomy of the message delivered from the word and musical texts is aptly described in MsSkullkid09’s response.

Presentation and Justification for the Implementation of Symbolic Convergence Theory

Fantasy Theme Analysis

SCT is rooted in Bales fantasy theme analysis as reapplied in a rhetorical situation by Bormann. Fantasy theme theory was first proposed to explain small group interactions by Bales (1970). Soon after, Bormann (1972) proposed that this theory could be used to analyze rhetorical acts. Since, the fantasy-theme analysis technique has been both supported (Bormann 1982a, 1982b, 1995; William, 1987) and refuted (Mohrmann, 1982a; Mohrmann 1982b). Meanwhile, rhetoricians have applied fantasy-theme analysis to a wide variety of rhetorical situations (Bishop, 2003; Drumheller, 2005; Dobris & White-Mills, 2006; Broom & Avanzino, 2010). A fantasy is a shared belief about reality created by a group of people through interactions within a specific sub-culture.

The shared understanding, perception of a situation, or “fantasy” is specific and shared by a group and reinforced through the group’s internal communication. Bormann expands, “The fantasy is imaginative even when presented as nonfiction, or ‘the truth.’ It is imaginative as it builds a life of its own in the particular group in which it is presented” (Ernest Bormann’s Official Webpage, para. 5). In spite of his opposition of the rhetorical application of fantasy-theme analysis, Mohrmann (1982a) helpfully explains, “[For] those who believe in the explanatory power of fantasy themes, fantasies may start almost
anywhere…; they social reality; they compel to action” (p.117). No matter the fantasy’s origin, fantasies are the shared truths which groups create and reaffirm reality as they see it and co-create it through communication acts.

Fantasy themes help create a situation-specific reality. Bormann calls this reality a “rhetorical vision” (Bormann, 1972, 1982b; Bormann, Cragan, & Shields, 1996; Bormann, Knutson, & Musolf, 1997), and the three types of themes help affirm this frame. Sonja Foss (2009) describes them as “setting themes, character themes, and action themes” (p. 99). The “setting themes” describe the “where”, the “character themes” describe the “who”, and the “action themes” describe the choices the “characters” make. Foss provides, “[The fantasy-theme criticism] contains fantasy-theme’s relation to settings, characters, and actions that together form a symbolic drama or a coherent interpretation of reality” (p.100).

Symbolic Convergence Theory

Bormann’s SCT is an extension of his interpretation of fantasy-theme analysis. Like fantasy-theme analysis, SCT assumes that people create reality through shared communication experiences. Palenchar and Heath (2002) expand, “SCT postulates that through their conversations and by attending to messages they encounter, people build a symbolic reality that furnishes meaning, emotion, and motive for action” (p. 134). SCT too deals with characters, settings, and action. Unlike fantasy-theme analysis, SCT focuses on the audiences’ role in a fantasy.

In the essay, “Why do people share fantasies? An empirical investigation of basic tenet of the symbolic convergence communication theory,” Bormann, Knutson, and Musolf (1997) elaborate:

The theory places the audience in the center of its communication paradigm and incorporates all elements of the communication situation including the
speaker or message source, the message, the context, and the audience (p. 254).

SCT examines the conditions in which fantasies are shared in order to define the shared group context for a fantasy.

Bormann, Cragan, and Shields (1996) explained in the essay, “An Expansion of the Rhetorical Vision Component of the Symbolic Convergence Theory: The Cold War Paradigm Case”, the three guiding principles that shape rhetorical visions: novelty, explanatory power, and imitation. The principle of novelty reflects the “newness” of a vision. The novel vision reflects the current circumstances when an older vision can no longer be used to understand current circumstances. Explanatory power is the element of the rhetorical vision that provides a way to understand new circumstances that are perceived as troubling or bewildering. The principle of imitation allows people who are confused or bored to reframe older fantasies into newer dramas.

In the article “The Use of Symbolic Convergence Theory in Corporate Strategic Planning: A Case Study,” (1992), Cragan and Shields clarified, “A fantasy theme functions to present a common experience and shape that experience rhetorically into symbolic knowledge” (p. 200). They defined 13 elements that they used to give “coherence to SCT” in situations concerning organizational communication. These elements were split into three categories: Basic Concepts (fantasy theme, symbolic cue, fantasy type, and saga), Dramatic Structural Concepts (rhetorical vision, dramatis personae, plotline, saga, scene, sanctioning agent, and master analogue), and Critical Evaluation Concepts (shared group consciousness, rhetorical vision reality, and fantasy theme artistry). All of these concepts are useful tools for evaluating rhetorical acts. However, the following concepts are the most appropriate tools
to analyze the rhetorical vision presented in the “Lie” and “Fist” artifacts: rhetorical vision, symbolic cues, fantasy theme, dramatis personae, plotline, scene, and fantasy theme artistry.

The Cragan and Shields case study presented the utilization of symbolic cues in a singular context. In a similar manner, I will use symbolic cues as building blocks to support the Dramatic Structural Concepts chosen for this analysis. The Dramatic Structural Concepts are used to illustrate the ways the fantasy themes chain out. To illustrate the Dramatic Structural Concepts, I will group the fantasy themes in a literary chain. As the fantasy themes build upon each other, their chain reveals how the Dramatic Structural Concepts support the overall Rhetorical Vision. The fantasy theme chains then support the overall Rhetorical Vision.

Similarly structured, a traditional SCT analysis presents itself as a vertical chain. As the fantasy themes chain out vertically, they develop into one overarching rhetorical vision. In the case of this analysis, I found that each chain is interdependent and can interact with the other chains within a cycle, which I call the Symbiotic Symbolic Convergence Cycle (SSCC). The cycle represents a symbiotic relationship between each of the fantasies. Each fantasy chain is expressed or reflected both metaphorically and as a lived experience within the “Lie” and “Fist” artifacts. The tools that Cragan and Shields provided, furnish a method to illustrate the SSCC model.

In the following section, I will first present the definitions that Cragan and Shields offered for the coherence providing concepts and align those concepts with the SSCC model. Next, the overall rhetorical vision will be presented using the three identified fantasy themes, and I will use Cragan and Shields tools to illustrate how those themes support the overall rhetorical vision. Once fully discussed, I will introduce how the fantasy theme
artistry choices that the rhetors choose impact the overall message and themes. To conclude this symbolic analysis, I will compare the SSCC to the Cycle of Violence.

**Rhetorical vision.** A rhetorical vision is the overall reality in which a group lives. Cragan and Shields considered a rhetorical vision, “a composite drama that catches up people into a common symbolic reality. Rhetorical visions reflect a life cycle of consciousness creating, raising, sustaining, declining, and terminus” (p. 201). Cragan and Shields asserted that a symbolic cue can be word or a group of words such as “code word, phrase, slogan, or even a nonverbal sign or gesture” (p. 200) that help signal past shared fantasies and feelings. Cues build and support fantasy themes which in turn build and support the rhetorical vision.

**Fantasy theme.** Cragan and Shields considered the fantasy theme to be an “initial unit of analysis.” A fantasy theme is a common belief about reality or life that is shared by the same group of people that is continually reinforced by experiences shared by a group. Dobris and White-Mills clarified, “As Bormann (1972) suggests fantasy themes may be based on reality or fiction, and function to create and reinforce a particular worldview for a community” (p. 28). Fantasy themes exist within small group communication and rhetorical acts. This element occurs within both fantasy theme analysis and SCT.

**Symbolic cues.** Fantasy themes within a rhetorical vision shared by a community or reflected in an artifact are communicated and reinforced through symbolic cues. Cragan and Shields (1992) defined, “A symbolic cue may be a code word, phrase, slogan, or even a nonverbal sign or gesture. A symbolic cue serves to trigger previously shared fantasies and emotions like the symbolic cue ’publish or perish’ for professors” (p. 200-201). Within the rhetorical artifact investigated in this document, symbolic cues are reflected by, but not
limited to, the production elements (e.g., colors, set design, makeup, and costume choices),
words, lyrics, and musical choices.

**Dramatis personae.** All rhetorical visions require people to create and preserve
them. Fantasy theme analysis calls these people characters. Cragan and Shields argued that
sometimes characters within a fantasy theme acquire or have stereotypical characteristics
attributed to them. These characteristics generally reduce a character to a protagonist or an
antagonist. This happens in the narratives that are shared within rhetorical communication
regularly. Dramatis personae provides a shorthand for those who want to promote or decry
others quickly.

**Plotline.** Cragan and Shields offered, “A plotline provides the action of a rhetorical
vision” (p. 201). A plotline is a chain of events that help support the fantasy. Plotlines take
place in interpersonal relationships, organizational fantasies, and in rhetorical
communications. These are the plotlines people expect to see when events occur. For
example, Americans experience similar plotlines roughly every four years during presidential
elections. These plotlines have specific predictable points to follow, yet every story the
public is caught in spins off new fantasies.

**Scene.** The scene is simply where the action takes place (Cragan and Shields, 1992).
In this case, the scene is comparable to a setting within a dramatic piece and is the situation
surrounding the action. In the analysis of Fantasy Theme and SCT, a scene is where the
players create a shared reality; it is a shared space and transitional in location.

**Fantasy theme artistry.** Cragan and Shields provided, “Fantasy theme artistry
centers on the rhetorical skill required to present scenarios in an attractive form so people
will come to share them” (p. 202-203). The ability to share a fantasy well can improve the
power of the fantasy.
Symbolic Convergence Cycle Analysis of the Artifacts

“Love the Way You Lie”

“Lie’s” overall fantasy theme artistry can be described as Gothic. The Gothic choices the rhetors make for this artifact romanticize the feel of the fantasy themes and shape the overall rhetorical vision in a piece of Gothic literature. Melani provided 12 elements that characterize classic Gothic literature. She informed, that “at least some of these elements” must be present in a story for it to be considered Gothic (Melani, 2002). Several of the elements are present in this artifact reflect the Gothic feel of the setting, plotline, and establish characters personae:

- A castle, ruined or intact, haunted or not
- Ruined buildings which are sinister or which arouse a pleasing melancholy
- Dungeons, underground passages, crypts, and catacombs which, in modern houses, become spooky basements or attics
- Labyrinths, dark corridors, and winding stairs
- Shadows, a beam of moonlight in the blackness, a flickering candle, or the
- Only source of light failing (a candle blown out or an electric failure)
- Extreme landscapes, like rugged mountains, thick forests, or icy wastes, and extreme weather
- Omens and ancestral curses
- Magic, supernatural manifestations, or the suggestion of the supernatural
- A passion-driven, wilful villain-hero or villain
- A curious heroine with a tendency to faint and a need to be rescued—frequently
- A hero whose true identity is revealed by the end of the novel
- Horrifying (or terrifying) events or the threat of such happenings (para. 6)

These Gothic elements serve as the symbolic cues that support the scene, plotline, and character personae symbolic cues within the fantasy theme chains and shape the rhetorical vision. The Gothic Fantasy Theme Artistry helps inform the Symbolic Convergence theory. Melani (2002) explained:
The Gothic creates feelings of gloom, mystery, and suspense and tends to the dramatic and the sensational, like incest, diabolism, and nameless terrors. Most of us immediately recognize the Gothic (even if we don't know the name) when we encounter it in novels, poetry, plays, movies, and TV series. For some of us—and I include myself, the prospect of safely experiencing dread or horror is thrilling and enjoyable (para. 7).

Domestic violence is a contemporary mysterious terror which is both “dramatic and sensational” (para. 7). It permeates societies across the globe and across social and racial lines. The “Lie” music artifact provides a way to safely and distantly experience this nightmare in four minutes and 27 seconds.

**Fantasy-themes of love, passion, and violence through the Gothic lens.** I have identified five Gothic Characteristics in the “Lie” music video artifact. These characteristics shape the Fantasy Theme Artistry of the three fantasy themes of Love, Passion, and Violence. I will discuss the five identified Gothic Characteristics and demonstrate how they are reflected in the elements of scene, dramatis personae, and plotline. Additionally, I will apply a modern interpretation to the 19th century sentiment of the Gothic Characteristics.

**Scene.** The scene that is provided in the “Lie” artifact is dark and has the realistic quality found in cinematic productions. The use of the Gothic elements that affect the scene serves to romanticize and support each of the three fantasy themes I have discovered. This house serves as a Gothic cue for all three of the fantasy themes.

- Ruined buildings which are sinister or which arouse a pleasing melancholy
- Shadows, a beam of moonlight in the blackness, a flickering candle, or the only source of light failing (a candle blown out or an electric failure) (Melani, para. 6)

The house in which the two characters live is dark and shabby. Both the exterior and interior of the building look run-down. The furniture appears to be used and worn. These cues paint the Gothic picture of a young couple that is starting off together in
perception of the romantic gloom of squalor. The Gothic mood provides an unsettling mood and builds the tension that hints at both passion and violence.

Most of the scenes featuring the characters are filmed in low light. Again this reflects poverty and young love starting out. The faint morning light dimly illuminates the couple, just as the female discovers another woman’s phone number written on her partner’s hand. This discovery triggers a jealous passionate fit, and the intense exchange soon escalates into violence. The story is romanticized through the darkness.

The use of light values paint the narrators as well. Rhianna’s scenes are dark as she provides the female perspective. However, as the male narrator, Eminem’s scenes are depicted with considerably more light. In his field shots, the light plays with camera; circular rings of light, that occasionally look like halos, flash on and off the screen. While he stands back in the light and describes his dark thoughts, the couple in the house visually depict the physical actions of those thoughts. Physically, Eminem portrays the hero in the light and Monaghan portrays the villain in the dark.

**Dramatis personae.** There are two characters in this drama which are represented by two narrators and two players. The narrators are portrayed by both Eminem and Rhianna, who reflect the thoughts of the players. The players are the portrayed by Megan Fox and Dominic Monaghan, and they act out the plotline which is dictated by Eminem.

- A passion-driven, willful villain-hero or villain (Melani, 2002)

In this drama, and within the Cycle of Violence, the male partner is both the villain and hero. He truly embodies the Gothic image of Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde. While Eminem provides the alibi, “I snap, ‘Who’s that dude?’ I don't even know his name,” Monaghan provides the violent action. The separating of the narrator and the action softens and romanticizes the Gothic villain personae and marks the fantasy theme of violence.
As the narrator, Eminem provides his voice to his rhetoric. He strengthens the words he raps because they are his own. A “passion-driven and willful villain” requires agency. His agency is strengthened because he provides his own detailed explanation of his position and responsibility within the drama. Within his first verses he depicts all the fantasy themes:

I can't tell you what it really is, I can only tell you what it feels like
And right now there's a steel knife in my windpipe (Eminem, 2010)

The “steel knife in my windpipe” evokes both passion and violence. Yet he does not tell you what it is. The passion of the moment over-takes him.

I can't breathe but I still fight while I can fight
As long as the wrong feels right it's like I'm in flight (Eminem, 2010)

The passion over-takes him again and justifies the violence. The “violence” was performed by a different player. This allows the “violence” to be separated from the hero-narrator, Eminem.

High off of love, drunk from my hate
It's like I'm huffin' paint and I love it, the more I suffer
I suffocate and right before I'm about to drown, she resuscitates me
She fuckin' hates me, and I love it (Eminem, 2010)

Love and hate are interchangeable, “High off of love” and “drunk from my hate,” as passion fuels both. The feeling is like he is high. In this stanza, the fantasy themes of violence and passion fuel the fantasy of love:

I'm Superman, with the wind at his back, she's Lois Lane
But when it's bad, it's awful, I feel so ashamed
I snapped, "Who's that dude?" I don't even know his name
I laid hands on her, I never stoop so low again
I guess I don't know my own strength (Eminem, 2010)
When he calls her “Lois Lane,” he refers to himself as the super hero, “Superman.” He recites the regret and implies his love for her. Eminem is narrating the cycle of abuse. He is dictating the action of himself and his partner. As he refers to himself as “Superman,” he is at this point holding all the power of the story.

Since “Lie” is a song on Eminem’s album, he is the primary rhetor of this artifact. As the primary rhetor, he provides most of the lyrics in the song, while Rhianna sings the same words repetitiously written by others. The audience hears a more in-depth perspective from Eminem, who represents the thoughts and the feelings of the male partner safely distanced from the action of the story, while Rhianna remains in the front of the fire repeating the same plea.

- A curious heroine with a tendency to faint and a need to be rescued—frequently (Melani, 2002)

Lake (2008) of the University of Missouri provides a more detailed explanation of the Gothic Heroine:

Central to almost all gothic texts are images of heroines in distress...The gothic heroine...is usually beset by an evil male suitor intent on possessing her fortune or her body or both. Gothic texts frequently contain images of women who have gone insane, have been kept captive by tyrannical men, or have been murdered. Generally speaking, the theme of a persecuted woman can be found in almost every gothic text (para. 22).

In this text, the heroine is portrayed by Rhianna, in the narrator role, and Fox in the player role. In this video, they both portray the modern Gothic heroine. Her parentage is unknown and unimportant. She may not be classically insane, but she does make choices that others might consider crazy. She is held captive. Eminem narrates the conversation while the players lip-sync:

Where are going?
I'm leaving you.
No you're not. (Eminem, 2010)

Still, much like the 18th century Gothic heroine, the “battered wife” is persecuted, pitied, and judged at the same time in our society. “Why doesn’t she just leave?” some would ask. This music video artifact does not provide a direct answer, but paints the modern female victim. She shows that she is willing to suffer violence which she justifies as passion in order to maintain love.

As the narrator, Rhianna depicts a limited reflection of the female partner’s thoughts and feelings. She sings the bridge in front of the burning house. As the representative of the inner most part of the female partner, she is physically removed from the action. She is present, yet not inside the house. In her case, she sings the lyrics that were written by Hafferman and Grant. The only words she provides are present at the beginning of this chapter. Her role in the song traps her as she repeats the same message during the bridge of the song. The beginning of the bridge is passive. As she sings, “Just gonna stand there and watch me burn,” she is asking her partner to save her from himself.

Next, she claims she likes the pain and the being lied too. She acknowledges that the violence will not stop, but she will voluntarily remain there. Again, violence is akin to passion and without passion there is nothing to provide a detailed perspective or background story. The audience sees the male partner providing the story for both him and the female partner. The structure of the song provides the male partner with more power and agency. She may not be curious or faint, but the female partner is appealing to her villain-hero, “Please rescue me.”
Fox is the player that initiates the physical violence. The violence starts with her jealousy. Jealousy, or passion, fuels her violence which begets his violence. Then Eminem’s voices the words that leave both of their mouths:

“Wait, where you going”?
“I’m leaving you,”
“No, you ain’t. Come back.” (Eminem, 2010)

The players are reflecting the drama that is Eminem’s description of the cycle of violence. The portrayal of these three lines reveals the rhetorical vision of this artifact, “Love is Pain.” As the narrator, Eminem is the agent of actions in this story. The rest of the characters simply reflect or react to his words.

**Plotline.** As previously stated, the “Love is Pain” artifact depicts the cycle of violence. The passion and violence themes are absolutely reflected in the Gothic motif. The romanticizing of the characters within the story suggests that love exists within the plot, “Horrifying (or terrifying) events or the threat of such happenings” (Melani, 2002).

The camera shots also provide a way to tell the story that defines the characters and shapes the way the viewers perceive the events. Wide angles are used for the majority of Eminem’s scenes. We, as the audience, are separated from him. He is not only vilified, his persona is strengthened. We can see his toned, muscled arms which are highlighted by his “wife beater” t-shirt.

In one scene, we see the muscular and tattooed arm of a man. The face is not shown; the viewer would have to know the arms of Eminem and Monaghan very well to be able to identify the owner of the arm. This shot dehumanizes the male character. His humanity is nonexistent. He is Dr. Jekyll, but without a face in the shot no one is taking responsibility for his actions.
The majority of Rhianna’s scenes are close-ups. We are intimately engaged with her. She looks flawless physically. There are no marks on her to be seen. Yet, she asks, if we are going to “stand there and watch her burn.” No marks are apparent in any of the players’ medium shot scenes either. The medium shots allow the audience to see the action, but they take some of the impact away from the violence. Overall, the way the story was filmed reinforced the character definitions and added to the way the plotline was shared.

**Gothic fantasy theme artistry.** The Gothic ascetic was used effectively to provide a clear interpretation of the cycle of violence from the heterosexual male partner’s perspective in the “Lie” music video artifact. In this vision, the male partner maintains control of the rhetorical reality and saves face through a variety of tactics which were outlined earlier. This dark, yet classically romantic, depiction shows the cycle of violence clearly. Both the rhetor and narrators wanted this message to reach their audience.

Welch on the other hand, did not view her work as a literal depiction of violence. Her lower cost production reflects this as well. In fact, her “Fist” music video artifact utilizes anti-Gothic fantasy theme artistry. I will use a few of Melani’s characteristics that illustrate the Gothic aesthetic and show how this tactic still supports the fantasy themes of Love, Passion, and Violence through the depiction of scene, character personae, and plotline.

**“Kiss With a Fist”**

**Fantasy theme artistry.** The rhetorical vision for “Fist” was communicated using a different approach to the fantasy theme artistry. This music artifact utilizes a minimalist perspective that is anti-Gothic in nature. It is playfully rebellious. The visuals and the music starkly contrast with the lyrics. Gwen Sharp’s website, *TheSocietyPages.org*, devoted a forum to discuss “Fist.” She provided this introduction:
Liz C. sent in the video for the song “A Kiss with a Fist (Is Better than None)” by Florence and the Machine. She analyzes it nicely:

The lyrics seem to condone domestic violence, and the video seems to trivialize it, in the sense that the lead singer prances and jumps around while singing about getting punched in the face, having her leg broken, and having plates broken over her head by her partner, while she, in turn, hits and slaps him, breaks his jaw, and refers to “The Burning Bed” by setting fire to their bed (para. 1).

The playful, bright, production belies the words the rhetor utters. Yet the words still support the fantasy themes of love, passion, and violence and the overall rhetorical vision through anti-Gothic fantasy artistry. I will use the same symbolic cues of scene, dramatis personae, and plotline as “Lie” to illustrate the theme and rhetorical vision for “Fist”.

**Scene.** The classic Gothic scene is, in itself, a character which provides the mood of the entire plot. The Gothic scenery is deeply detailed and mysterious. The scene provides complicated landscapes and structures that enrich the plot and reflect the characters’ trails.

The “Fist” video artifact depicts a completely opposite scene from the Gothic aesthetic. Melani provides the characteristics of the Gothic scene:

- A castle, ruined or intact, haunted or not
- Ruined buildings which are sinister or which arouse a pleasing melancholy
- Dungeons, underground passages, crypts, and catacombs which, in modern houses, become spooky basements or attics
- Labyrinths, dark corridors, and winding stairs
- Shadows, a beam of moonlight in the blackness, a flickering candle, or the only source of light failing (a candle blown out or an electric failure)
- Extreme landscapes, like rugged mountains, thick forests, or icy wastes, and extreme weather…(Melani, 2002)

The background of the video appears to be a stark white sound stage. Set against the white are props that appear cartoon-like. All of the props and Welch’s clothing are highly saturated in color. Props appear to be low cost depictions rather than realistic pieces. For instance, the bed does not have a mattress. Instead of a mattress, strips of red and orange
cellophane are tied to the bed and blown upwards by a fan to depict fire. There is a scene with blue and white paper lanterns that Welch hits with a stick like they are piñatas. Welch also dances around with a heart shaped flower arrangement that looks like it belongs on a casket. Simply stated, the scene depicts a low-cost slightly perverse party. Additionally, the colors’ contrast with the simple white background serves as a passion cue.

The scene that Welch creates with her lyrics depicts the love, passion, and violence fantasy themes:

My black eye casts no shadow
Your red eye sees nothing
Your slaps don't stick
Your kicks don't hit
So we remain the same
Love sticks
Sweat drips
Break the lock if it don't fit
A kick to the teeth is good for some
A kiss with a fist is better than none (Welch, 2009)

Our injuries do not hurt because “Love sticks,” “so we remain the same.” When our “sweat drips” we have proven our passion. “A kick to the teeth is good for some; a kiss with a fist is better than none,” reinforces the violence-passion-love cycle.

**Dramatis personae.** There are only two characters physically depicted. Neither of whom are well fleshed out. Modern Gothic literature provides fleshed out characters that are ambiguously complex and include both good and evil. Welch and a male who could be her partner are not complex, nor do they fit the male and female molds provided by the Gothic blueprint. Welch is the main character and the narrator. Unlike Eminem, she owns her violent acts. She hits a piñata baton against her hand as if she is about to use it as a weapon. She sings about getting plates broken over her head, yet she is the one breaking plates over
the male character’s head. Therefore the characteristics that Melani provides were not seen
in the “Kiss” video:

• A passion-driven, willful villain-hero or villain
• A curious heroine with a tendency to faint and a need to be rescued–frequently
• A hero whose true identity is revealed by the end of the novel (Melani, 2002)

Additionally, the male character is not Gothic. He seems weak and one dimensional. He appears to be little more than a prop himself. He does not resemble the Gothic hero and is presented as less than weak or meek Gothic female. He could be her partner, however, she appears annoyed to see him and disgusted with his presence. Rather, she appears to be happier singing and dancing for the camera about a passionately violent love than displaying affection to the male character.

**Plotline.** Gothic literature depicts the grossly frightening; the scenes are dark and hint that something malevolent may be hiding around the corner. Melani describes these events as, “Horrifying (or terrifying) events or the threat of such happenings” (2002). The thought that something catastrophic may happen is a constant tension within the plot, scene, and characters.

The plotline of “Fist” is depicted through the song lyrics. The video does not support the story in this artifact. The contrasting messages of the lyrics versus the music and visuals trivialize the violence that is depicted in the lyrics. The feeling of this artifact reflects an atmosphere of anticipation. Violence is embraced rather than feared. Unlike the “Lie” video artifact, which depicts violence as something that one suffers through to prove her or his love, “Fist” embraces the language of violence cheerfully. The chorus outlines the present situation for the couple:
You hit me once
I hit you back
You gave a kick
I gave a slap
You smashed a plate over my head
Then I set fire to our bed, oh…

A kick to the teeth is good for some
A kiss with a fist is better than none

A kiss with a fist is better than none

One verse discusses previous violent interactions:

I broke your jaw once before
I spilled your blood upon the floor
You broke my leg in return (Welch, 2009)

The ending of the verse discussed the passion linked with the violence:

So sit back and watch the bed burn
Love sticks
Sweat drips
Break the lock if it don’t fit (Welch, 2009)

Throughout the song the fantasy themes of love, violence, and passion reinforce the overall rhetorical vision that “Love is Pain.” The way this message is delivered both visually and musically makes the violence discussed in the lyrics look like fun.

**Rhetorical Vision and Fantasy Themes**

Despite the rhetors’ conflicting intentions and delivery choices, the rhetorical vision of both artifacts and the chains that lead to the visions are identical for “Lie” and “Fist”. I have identified the rhetorical vision of “Love is Pain.” The main chains that have emerged from the artifacts are: “Passion,” “Violence,” and “Love.” These chains are reflected within the chorus of these artifacts:

A kiss with a fist is better than none (Welch, 2007).

That’s alright, because I like the way it hurts (Hafferman & Grant n.d.).
These lines provide a microcosm of the underlying fantasies of passion, violence, and love. One can interpret the delivery of these lines by female rhetors to say, “You hurt me, and I will not only take it but I will accept it because it proves how much I love you.” The fantasy themes depicted are dependent on the others. The previous analysis exhibits the symbiotic relationship these fantasies share. A fantasy must have at least one of the other two fantasies within a symbolic cue in order to function as a support of the Rhetorical Vision.

The Symbiotic Convergence Cycle of IPV

Fantasies traditionally chain out. I attempted to chain out the themes I found in the “Kiss” and “Lie” artifacts which is depicted in figure one. I have found within this analysis that the fantasies do not chain out in the traditional linear chain that most SCT analysis conclude.
In this case, the fantasies exist within a cycle. Figure four depicts the Symbiotic Convergence Cycle for Intimate Partner Violence (SCCIPV). Note the two-way arrows. Within the world of mathematics these arrows denote biconditional relationships. When present, these arrows signify the relationship of “if and only if.” Both variables must be true or both variables must be false for the variables to be biconditional. In this case, the truth table depicted in figure two illustrates the relationships that each of the fantasy themes share in SCCIPV found in the two music video artifacts analyzed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Violence (V)</th>
<th>Passion (P)</th>
<th>Love (L)</th>
<th>Equals True</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>V ↔ P</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P ↔ L</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>T</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>V ↔ L</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The arrows in this case indicate that there is a symbiotic relationship between these fantasy themes that support the Rhetorical Vision of “Love is Pain.” As noted above, the depiction of the scene, characters personae, and the plotline serves as symbolic cues that help illustrate the fantasy themes of love, passion, and violence which support the “Rhetorical Vision” of “Love is Pain.” This “Rhetorical Vision” is identical in both artifacts despite the conflicting fantasy theme artistry styles.
In the case of the two music video artifacts investigated in this chapter, the phases of the Cycle of Violence (Figure three) are exchangeable with the phases of Symbiotic Convergence Cycle. One can easily see that a “Violent Episode” can be exchanged for “Violence” and “Love”, which in turn can be exchanged for the “The Honeymoon Phase.” I contend that the “Tension Building Phase” is depicted as “Passion” within both of the artifacts. This symbolic exchange recodes the rhetorical presentation of IPV. The phase of “Tension Building” and this fantasy of passion include an anticipatory feeling. As depicted in both videos, the cycle can occur cyclically, one or more phase may occur simultaneously, or the phases can occur out of order.

Ultimately, the SCC of IPV (Figure four) recodes the Cycle of Violence. It reveals how an entertainment medium can romanticize, reduce, and glorify violence until it is reread as passion. I have demonstrated this with two vastly different message delivery styles from
artists with opposite message intentions through implementing fantasy theme analysis and SCT. Eminem and Rhianna wanted to depict the Cycle of Violence, but they failed to see that Gothic style of their message provided a romantic view of IPV. Welch’s attempt to talk about a passionate romantic relationship provided a message that was ambiguous and provided a celebration of IPV.

This chapter has explored the effect of rhetor’s intent in the music video artifacts of “Love the Way You Lie” and “Kiss with a Fist.” Implementing the symbolic convergence theory demonstrated that these videos suggest a celebration of IPV through the recoding of the cycle known as the “Cycle of Violence.” The rhetor’s intent shaped the fantasy theme artistry. The fantasy theme artistry directly affected the symbolic cues of scene, dramatis personae, and plotline. These cues helped depict the fantasy themes of violence, passion, and love. These fantasy themes chained out to provide the overall rhetorical vision of, “Love is Pain.”
Music Video in the Modern Era

_The Buggles_ song titled, “Video Killed the Radio Star”, ushered in the music television age. This video launched Music Video Television (MTV) at 12:01 a.m. on August 01, 1981. MTV was the first station in the United States that had a programming format focused on presenting music videos. This station with its rock music format quickly became popular with teenagers and young adults, and other music video stations soon emerged. VH1, Country Music Television (CMT), Black Entertainment Television (BET), and The BOX soon started playing videos from other genres of music.

Soon after, music television became a part of American youths’ everyday life; the public became obsessed with the effects of rock music and the rock music video (Greenfield et al, 1987). By the mid to late 1980s, academics began to focus on music video artifacts (Kinder, 1984; Hurley, 1994). The music video continues to be a major component of the preteen, adolescent, and young adult media consumption diets (American Academy of Pediatrics: Council on Communications and Media, 2009). Even though music television stations have radically changed their programming since their launch in the 1980s, music videos are still readily available on the internet from a variety of sources.

From the time it was launched, MTV’s programming provided a cultural template. Whether they were aware or not, MTV’s programmers served as cultural gatekeepers for preadolescents, adolescents, and young adults. At first, MTV remained with a format that focused on showing primarily white artists’ rock and roll videos. Those with MTV argued that the rock and roll format would not allow room for other genres such as pop music (Chiu, 2013). However, many argued that the MTV video programming choice was narrow
and shut out most black artists’ opportunities to share their music clips on the station (Alban, 2009). Despite the criticism, MTV executives continued with the narrow genre format, until Michael Jackson released his first two music singles from his *Thriller* album, “Bill Jean” (1983) and “Beat It” (1983). Many agree that these videos revolutionized the nature of the music video (McGrath, 1996).

The music video quickly became and remains a useful artifact for social scientists and critics everywhere to measure and critique, not only youth culture, but society as a whole (American Academy of Pediatrics: Council on Communications and Media, 2009). The music video microcosm continues to allow researchers a salient sample of culture. At first, the means of examining the music video were primarily rhetorical in nature, then content analysis became a popular means of study. Eventually, social scientists started to use the music video to examine the music video’s impact on cultural norms through effects research. Scholars today examine the music video through rhetorical, qualitative, and quantitative methods in search of insight into this medium of artistic communication. This thesis presents a method which utilizes quantitative and critical approaches. Chapter Two: “A Rhetorical Criticism”, addresses the music videos “Love the Way You Lie” by Eminem and Florence Welch’s “Kiss with a Fist”. The present chapter contains a literature review.

This chapter will first provide a review of both content analysis and interpretation research as they apply to music videos. Next, brief histories of the hip-hop and punk music genres will be provided. Music video effects research will precede a presentation of Cultivation Theory. Next the mode of transportation will be described. The last element of this study, EE, will be defined and a brief history of how it has been utilized will be presented. Finally, the elements of this study will be used to introduce the research questions for the experiment.
Music Video and Music Genre

Music Video and Content Analysis

Numerous content analyses have been conducted on music videos. One such analysis, in the *American Journal of Health Education*, was conducted by King, Laake, and Bernard (2006), who released the results in the article: “Do the depictions of sexual attire and sexual behavior in music videos differ based on video network and character gender?” This article focused on sexual attire and behavior within music videos from four major music video channels (BET, MTV, MTV2, and Great American Country [GAC]). The researchers counted each time a music video depicted sexual behavior or dress. They found that music videos on BET scored an average of 758.88 sexual depictions per video while the second most frequent depictions were on MTV which averaged 206.75 depictions. Through content analysis, they found that women wore sexual attire more often and behaved sexually at a much higher rate than men in music videos.

Smith (2005) provided a literature review of content analyses detailing more than 20 years of music video channels. In this literature review, she included a graph that listed content analyses from 1985 to 2004 of channels that included music video programing. The article provided a literature review of 20 different content analyses studies conducted, which included reporting on nine channels with music videos in their programing. Out of the 20 studies, 18 investigated music videos, while the other two studies focused on reality programing. Among the studies coded, 16 coded violent content, 13 coded sexual content, and seven coded substance abuse. Smith ended her article with a quote from the then president of programing at MTV, MTV2, and MTV Films, Van Toffler. Toffler stated that as the audience programing preferences shift, so will MTV’s programing away from music video content. This change of the music video channel’s programing redirected the music
video audience away from television; now music videos are found on the internet. Thanks to this shift, and the abundance of new “smart” technology, music videos are instantly available and viewable via a plethora of devices (e.g., handheld and mobile devices). The availability and accessibility of music content has widened, while the means of transmission has allowed people to individualize their video content diet.

Araüna (2012) continued content analysis regarding the portrayal of women in international musical portrayals. She suggested that a subgenre of music videos may exist, which depicts, “both members of a couple beat[ing] each other (until death)” (p. 243). An example of this subgenre can be found in the song “Love the Way You Lie”, which extensively examined in Chapter Two of this thesis. Araüna asserted that passion fuels physical confrontation in the “Love the Way You Lie” video. She elaborates:

Hurts, physical fighting becomes the fuel of passion, as exemplified by the chorus in the controversial Rihanna and Eminem video ‘I Love the Way You Lie’ (Kahn 2010)… It must be said that in romantic-oriented videos, like Rihanna’s and Iglesias’, women tend to be the victims of physical aggressions, whereas in more frivolous or humoristic products, like Maroon 5’s, women are the physically aggressive agents (p. 243).

Araüna discussed the eroticizing of violence and the normalizing of IPV, while providing music video examples within in many subgenres of popular music. These examples suggested that IPV is permissible in situations where both romantic partners are engaged in aggressive behaviors.

As examined in Chapter Two, depictions of IPV where both partners engage in physical abuse justifies, eroticizes, and sanitizes situations that involve unhealthy relational practices. Content analysis establishes and documents the existence of depictions of violence, drugs, and misogynistic attitudes. Another way to explore music videos is through
effects research. This technique gives researchers an idea of how video images shape the way people view themselves and those around them.

**Interpretation research.** People bring their own experiences and perspectives to music video viewing, including those videos watched in social research laboratories. These viewpoints shape the way messages are interpreted (Berry & Shelton, 1999). For example, researchers have established that men are more likely than women to ascribe to attitudes that support traditional gender roles, rape myths, and adversarial sexual beliefs than women before experimentation (Kalof, 1999; Storch, Bagner, Geffken, & Baumeister, 2004; Kistler & Lee, 2009).

Gender is not the only aspect that affects participants’ interpretation of music video messages. Genre predilections and the link to attitudes about women have been explored. Rubin, West, and Mitchell (2001) conducted a study that investigated the relationship between “dispositions, popular music preferences and attitudes” (p. 25). Out of the sample of 243 undergraduate student participants, they discovered that those who preferred heavy-metal music had a lower regard for women than the other participants, while those who preferred rap music were found to be more generally aggressive. Rubin, West, and Mitchell noted that their music samples had relatively high self-esteem and were not especially angry. They suggested that this study could be done with different populations. Also this study revealed that the undergraduate participants had a noteworthy attitude difference about socially deviant behavior involving violence and attitudes about women. Those who identified themselves as rap listeners were found to be less trusting and more aggressive. Whereas, heavy-metal fans had a less positive regard of women than their rap listener counterparts. More research with other populations would add to the understanding the relationship between aggression and attitudes about women.
Culture plays a part in interpretation of an artifact as well. In 1990, Brown and Schulze looked into fandom, gender, and culture during a study that investigated reactions to Madonna’s “Papa Don’t Preach” and “Open Your Heart” music videos. They found that female participants thought that the dance between Madonna and the boy featured in the “Open Your Heart” was platonic, whereas the male participants thought that the dance symbolized sexual love. The word “baby” in “Papa Don’t Preach” was thought to denote a human infant by white participants, while black participants thought that Madonna was referring to her boyfriend. The authors concluded that race and gender affect the way people interpret the messages they receive from media.

Effects research. When scholars began to critically examine the music video realm in the early and mid-1980s, they focused their research to determine if the visual image affected the audio message. Straw (1988) explained the main focus of criticism, “Would the music video image overtake the listeners’ ability to interpret the musical message for themselves?” Straw claimed that there was a concern that record companies would eventually cultivate homogenous music videos that only promoted the subversive rock and roll subculture. The fear that young listeners would not be able to think freely for themselves carried over into experimental research. In the article, “What is Rock Music Doing to the Minds of our Youth? A First Experimental Look at the Effects of Rock Music Lyrics and Music Videos” Greenfield et al (1987), reported that a rock song did indeed induce more feelings than the same song coupled with images. The fear that images paired with audio may diminish the musical experience and the music consumer’s ability to independently form salient, complex images, continues to be the focus of many media studies today (e.g., studies that involve moving images paired with sound).
After the experiments conducted by Greenfield et al., research questions evolved into queries that focused on how societal mores were reflected or reinforced in music videos. Early effects research conducted with music video has revealed that music video has the ability to encourage the acceptance of stereo-typical gender roles for both males and females (Hall-Hansen, 1989; Hansen & Hansen, 1988). Some studies have revealed that men are more affected by the messages of stereotypical gender and sexuality-related attitudes depicted in media (Galdi, Maass, and Cadinu 2013) and specifically in music videos (St. Lawrence and Joyner, 1991; Kistler and Lee, 2010; Stevens, Aubry, Hooper, and Mbure, 2011). Johnson, Jackson, and Gatto (1995) conducted an experiment with African American male high school students. They found that after watching violent music videos young men were more likely to react favorably to violent narratives that included interpersonal violence between males and interpersonal violence between a male and female than those who were exposed to nonviolent rap videos and the control group. Other research has revealed that females are more affected by negative gender-related music video messages than males (Kalof, 1999; Johnson et al., 1995).

More recent research has demonstrated that investigating populations outside of the undergraduate participant pool revealed results that supported past findings. Ward, Hansbrough, and Walker (2005) conducted a study with 152 African American high school students (70% were female). The researchers sought to find the impact of music video viewing on adolescent views of gender. They found a link between music video viewing and traditional gender role attitudes. Additionally, students who viewed videos with stereotypical depictions were more likely to ascribe to traditional views about gender stereotypes.

The effect violence portrays in music videos has been heavily scrutinized. The American Academy of Pediatrics released a report titled, “Impact of Music, Music Lyrics,
and Music Videos on Children and Youth” (2009), which stated that exposure to violent rap music videos or sexist videos have a negative impact on young male viewers. Research reflected that male participants reported “an increased probability that they would engage in violence, a greater acceptance of the use of violence, and a greater acceptance of the use of violence against women than did participants who were not exposed to these videos” (p. 1491). Cultivating the attitude that violence is common, expected, normal, and at times celebrated, has and continues to be a focus of experimental research (St. Lawrence and Joyner, 1991; Johnson, Adams, Ashburn and Reed, 1995; Johnson, Jackson, and Gatto, 1995; Rustad et al., 2003; Enck and McDaniel, 2012).

Punk. The punk musical esthetic emphasizes simplicity with songs that are short, loud, and fast. Many punk musicians started out barely knowing how to play instruments, which explains why many Punk songs are four cords. Punk artists think that anyone can write a song and play it (Grossman, 1996-1997). Many assert that with its inception into the North American and Great Britain scenes, punk redefined rock music in terms of the relationship it had with the audience, the greater public, and music itself (Grossberg, 1986; Straw, 1988; Grossman, 1996-1997).

Punk was created by young, lower-middle class youth in Great Britain and the United States, yet as it grew in popularity, youth from a wide variety of backgrounds became fans (Grossman, 1996-97). Punk continues to be created around the world today. The punk esthetic is critical of political issues, social issues, and of music itself. Russia’s Pussy Riot is a current example of the punk musical style being used as a political voice. Punk emerged in the late 1970s, and since has evolved and been co-opted and adapted by other music forms and mainstream entertainment media (Grossberg, 1986).
Punk provided an opportunity for women to voice their agendas. Kathleen Hanna (also known as Julie Ruin) uses her music to discuss political issues that affect women. Rather than approach her songs with a singing voice, Hanna, like many of her fellow punk contemporaries, would sometimes scream and other times yell/sing her lyrics to songs such as “Jigsaw Youth” (1994). Hanna criticizes societal standards:

I can sell my body if I wanna
God knows you already sold your mind
I may sell my body for money sometimes…
We know there's not one way, one light, one stupid truth
Don't fit your definitions
Don't need your demands
Not into win lose reality
Won't fit in with your plan

Punk has historically provided an outlet for angry musings that were a commentary on culture. Hanna elaborated on her website: “From 1989-1997, I was in this Olympia, Washington punk band. Our songs mixed feminist theory with the realities of our lives and were meant to inspire more girls to participate in the music scene” (Hanna, n.d.). Hanna and her fellow Riot Grrrl cohorts used the punk genre to amplify that their voices and further they agenda for equality in the music industry and the greater society (Wald, 1998). Riot Grrrl was one of the many subgenres of punk that have developed over the years.

Much of the academic literature that focuses on punk’s history, describes the culture of the various subgenres (Grossberg, 1986; Grossman, 1996-97) or the different types of punk music based on geographical location (Dean, 2002; O’Conner, 2002). One study conducted by Hall-Hansen and Hansen (1991) investigated both punk and heavy-metal fans. Their findings suggest that punk fans were more drawn to antisocial behavior such as vandalism, shoplifting, and were more likely to go to jail than those who were not fans of the genre.
In its beginning, punk music was primarily produced and consumed by poor and working class white youth from the United States and Great Britain, and punk bands remained mainly regional. Throughout the years, some punk techniques were adapted into mainstream pop and rock. Meanwhile, some punk bands signed on with major American recording labels and experienced wider distribution privileges (Lopes, 1992) than those bands that stayed regional. Lewis (1988) elaborates:

For a long time…punk performers kept…at the fringes of the larger music industry, which relied on cooperation and relatively smooth coordination to maintain their high rate of cultural production (p. 42) …Most British punk music that has been heard in the United States is distributed by large record conglomerates like EMI, and most bands that are signed to these companies … (p. 43).

Other bands could not stay together and fell apart as easily as they were formed (Lewis, 1988). The anti-establishment, anarchist attitude that punk performers had prevented band longevity, and most bands refused to cooperate with mainstream agents who produced traditional music videos. Punk, however has left a mark that effects mainstream music today.

Hip-Hop. On January 5, 1980, The Sugarhill Gang launched the genre of hip-hop into mainstream consciousness of America when their song, “Rapper’s Delight” became the first hip-hop song to reach the Billboard top 40 list (History.com, n.d.). With this song, a new voice was given to a disenfranchised population. Steinmetz and Henderson (2012) explained, “[This] music is a medium for the transmission of common experiences, struggles, and aspirations to other members of the Hip-Hop community and listeners from all strata of society: domestic and international” (p. 156). Like punk musicians, hip-hop artists use their medium to speak out about societal norms that they feel are wrong. However, while the majority of punk artists are white, most hip-hop artists are African American.
Many believe that the stereotypes and misconceptions that are associated with the African American population were transferred to attitudes that persist about hip-hop (Reyna, Brandt, and Viki 2009; Nielson, 2010; Steinmetz and Henderson, 2012; Kubrin and Nielson 2014). This genre and its rhetors have been scrutinized, criticized, and studied by the media, mainstream critics, politicians, and academics. Hip-hop musicians, primarily “Gansta Rappers”, have well documented run-ins with the law (Staples, 2005; Drake, and Insanul, 2012). This issue of law enforcement encounters, in combination with the content of some hip-hop lyrics, has led some to argue that the genre encourages violence, misogyny, and materialism (Krohn & Suazo, 1995; Kubrin, 2005).

Indeed content analysis has revealed these themes. Researchers Conrad, Dixon, and Zhang conducted a content analysis of 108 popular rap music videos released in 2006. From that analysis, they produced four articles (Conrad, Dixon, and Zhang, 2009; Dixon, Zhang, and Conrad, 2009; Zhang, Dixon, and Conrad 2009; Zhang, Dixon, and Conrad, 2010). Each of these articles discussed the presence of materialism, violence, and misogyny in the artifacts. Other content analyses of hip-hop artifacts have supported Conrad, Dixon, and Zhang’s findings (Smith, 2005).

Many researchers have focused their scholarship efforts on misogynistic themes within hip-hop artifacts. Adams and Fuller (2006) define misogyny as, “the hatred or disdain of women. It is an ideology that reduces women to objects for men's ownership, use, or abuse. It diminishes women to expendable beings” (p. 939). Misogynistic attitudes are not exclusively found in hip-hop lyrics, however they are regularly available within hip-hop videos (Dixon, Yang, and Conrad, 2009; Smith, 2005) and have attracted critics from both academic and mainstream circles.
Kistler and Lee (2010) studied the short term effects of sexual objectification of women in hip-hop messages on college students. They found that male participants who viewed five videos with high content of misogynistic themes “expressed the higher levels of objectification of women, stereotyped gender attitudes, and acceptance of rape myths” (p. 82). Additionally, they found that fans of hip-hop were more affected by the content than nonfans, and women were overall not significantly affected by the music video content. However, attitudes about the content portrayed and its effects on women were two different variables.

Capodilupo and Kim (2012) conducted a series of six focus groups consisting of black women. The groups discussed the way women were portrayed and treated within hip-hop videos. One participant stated, “In the case of black men in rap videos, they surround themselves with women who are like, skinny girls in bathing suits...with long hair that’s straight as can be” (p. 7). Others in the study discussed similar observations. Many of those studied found that hip-hop music videos did not portray their physical type. These young women’s assessments reflected their anger about the narrowed view of beauty and attitudes about women in hip-hop music videos. Furthermore, Peterson et al. (2007) found that African American adolescent females (ages 14-18) were negatively affected by hip-hop imagery.

…perceiving more portrayals of sexual stereotypes in rap music videos was associated with numerous health outcomes, including binge drinking, testing positive for marijuana, having multiple sexual partners, and having a negative body image (p. 1161).

This in-depth study conducted with younger participants yielded results that suggested that hip-hop is more influential than other theorists have postulated. Even though, older participants partook in the focus group study, these two studies together suggested that
younger females may be more negatively affected by images they see. It is important to note, focus groups allow more room for elaboration of thought, however focus groups create an environment where attitudes can be adjusted and shifted by others. During focus groups the participants can create a “group think” environment and this setting may affect the data collected.

**Modes of Inquiry and Ways of Understanding**

**Cultivation Theory**

Several theories concerning the way music videos and other entertainment mediums shape and preserve attitudes have been postulated. Many of them have been applied to music video inquiry. This study applies Cultivation Theory to ascertain the way attitudes about IPV may be shaped by music video storytelling. Gerbner introduced Cultivation Theory as a way to explain the effect that regular extensive television exposure can have on viewers and tested this theory throughout his career (Gerbner, Gross, Morgan, & Signorielli, 1986; Gerbner, 1998; Gerbner, 2000; Gerbner, 2003). Cultivation Theory asserts that attitudes and values are reinforced or learned through media consumption, mainly televised media. Therefore, those who view television regularly have their perceptions of reality shaped by this practice. And even though the views that are portrayed are not always correct, they are nevertheless taken to be truth by those whom consume them via television programing. Cultivation Theory is one of the most often used theories in media effects research. Bryant and Miron (2004) discovered that from 1956 to 2000, Cultivation Theory was the third most utilized theory in prominent scholarly journal articles of the period. Morgan and Shanahan (2010) reported that from 2000-2010 more than 125 studies directly involving Cultivation Theory were published.
In 1968, Gerbner and a team of researchers started a project called *Cultural Indicators*. This research inspired a large body of research on television viewing effects. After conducting more than 30 years of research, in 2000 Gerbner stated the following regarding his conclusions about television:

Television is a centralized system of story-telling. Its drama, commercials, news and other programs bring a relatively coherent system of images and messages into every home. That system cultivates from infancy the predispositions and preferences that used to be acquired from other 'primary' sources and that are so important in research on other media (p. 4).

Today, the storytelling mechanisms that Gerbner described are found in even more intimate proximity to us, the palms of our hands. We are exposed to the types of narrative programing that Gerbner described more now than ever before. Cultivation Theory describes the “what” of the process of having cultural mores shaped through narrative media but not the details of the “how.”

**Transportation**

Transportation is the act of being drawn into a text. Gerrig (1993) introduced the concept of transportation through metaphor. He describes a foray into a text as if it were like proceeding on a physical trip. In this explanation, a traveler moves from one location (his or her current reality) to another setting (the narrative reality with which that person chooses to interact). Gerrig asserted that this phenomenon can take place within a variety of differing fictional and nonfictional texts. He used mostly literary examples but claimed that this phenomena can occur to a person while watching a film, theatrical performance, or even by looking at a piece of art. Being transported into a text is much like making a trip in reality. The “traveler” (the reader) uses a “vehicle” (a text) to go to a different location. The traveler arrives home from the trip “somewhat changed by the journey” (p. 10). Or as
Green (2004) put it, “the reader may consciously or unconsciously push real-world facts aside and instead engage the narrative world created by the author” (p. 248). During the transportation process, the “traveler” suspends reality and goes to a different plain of existence. Transportation can occur during a 500 page novel or during an afternoon soap opera.

Slater and Rouner (2002) defined transportation as the degree to which a message recipient is cognitively and effectively invested in a narrative. By invested, they mean that attention is fully engaged and emotional responses coincide with the vicarious experience of fictional events. For instance, transportation is the phenomenon that occurs when readers lose themselves in a novel. Transportation happens by degrees depending on the investment of the “traveler”, the qualities of the text, and the amount of interference present during the traveling experience.

Green and Brock (2000) operationalized this concept with their Transportation Scale. They defined transportation as “a distinct mental process, an integrative melding of attention, imagery, and feelings” (p. 701). The scale they created asks text “travelers” questions that help ascertain the degree in which they were drawn into a text. The authors reported the outcome of three experiments to study transportation effects. Since these pivotal experiments were conducted in 2000, the Transportation Scale has been adapted and repeated in many experiments. Research has found that transportation occurs in a wide range of textual circumstances and can help persuade “travelers” to change their beliefs (Green, 2004; Green, et al., 2008; Murphy et al., 2011; Quintero-Johnson, Harrison, and Quick, 2013).

Green, Brock, and Kaufman (2004) argue that stories are the most fundamental method of thought; therefore, the likelihood of becoming transported into other worlds is a
natural ability. They asserted that being transported into a fictional world (through either media or written text) is linked to the enjoyment of the text and “provides insight into the underlying mechanisms” of media enjoyment. People choose to be transported for several reasons: for escape, for enjoyment, to form parasocial relationships, and mood management. Their research also affirmed that the degree of transportation is affected by the quality of the story presented. Texts which are rich in detail and created by artists rather than researchers are more affective transporters. The amount of transportation into a text is also affected by external factors. Just like interpersonal communication can be affected by outside factors (e.g., physical surroundings or internal interference), so can the level of transportation.

Researchers have investigated how previous experience with texts, and themes within a text (e.g., familiarity), can influence the method and the extent of transportation. Green (2004) reported an experiment which explored the relationship between the familiarity of themes and transportation within a written text. Green reported that participants who were familiar with the story’s themes experienced deeper levels of transportation than those who were not as familiar. Furthermore, increased perceptions of realism were associated with transportation; those who experienced transportation were more likely to endorse “story-consistent beliefs” (p. 252). The study found that imbedding information within the study directions did not help with familiarity and therefore transportation. This suggested that those who are transported need to be exposed to themes for longer periods of time before transportation effects can be increased by familiarity. Therefore strengthening the link between cultivation and transportation.

Green conducted related transportation research with Kass, Carrey, Herzig, Feeney, and Sabini (2008) which explored the effects of combining film and written text mediums. This study investigated how previous exposure to the same story via a different medium
could affect the depth of transportation into a text. They compared the experience of transportation through two stories, *The Rainmaker* and *Harry Potter and the Chamber of Secrets*, and conducted two different experiments. They found that those who were exposed to the story via written text first and then saw the film experienced the furthest degree of transportation.

Transportation is an important tool that can explain why people are not only entertained but why they are moved to change attitudes and opinions once exposed to new information and ideas (Green, Brock, & Kaufman, 2004). Those who are transported can do so into text from a multitude of different mediums, fictional and nonfictional texts, and both pleasant and unpleasant texts (Gerrig, 1993). The concept of transportation has been explored in a wide array of different situations and has helped explain the relationship that we have with messages within texts.

**Cultivation and Transportation**

Shrum, Lee, Burroughs, and Rindfleisch, (2011) asserted that one of the claims of Cultivation Theory (i.e., television provides a regular narrative which persuades viewers to hold specific values and beliefs about life) could be supported through transportation. The process of transportation provides a measurable tool with which to measure the extent one is drawn into a narrative. This process shows how narratives can entice people into a story that supports a more or value. The further a person is drawn into a narrative, the greater the narrative’s persuasive power becomes, thus shaping a person’s belief about cultural values and mores (Green, 2004; Green & Brock, 2000).

Bilandzic and Busselle (2008) explored the relationship between familiarity and transportation within the medium of film. They attempted to see if repeated transportation experiences led to acculturation during the viewing of a feature length film. However, they
did not find conclusive evidence connecting transportation to acculturation in this study. They did discover that three of the four cases they documented revealed that attitude measures and transportation were more strongly correlated after the exposure. They also found a correlation suggesting that cultural views reinforced within a genre are gradually reinforced with each exposure. They admitted acculturation was a difficult theory to prove within only one study. This study established that transportation can occur within a film viewing.

McKinley (2012) conducted a study which built on the foundation laid by Bilandzic and Busselle. This study directly sought to determine if a link between cultivation and transportation existed. Specifically, he wanted to determine if the main component of cultivation theory, i.e., high viewing frequency, contributed to the transportation experienced during a viewing experience. Findings indicated a significant link between high frequency viewing of genre-specific programming and perceived realism with transportation. However, overall high frequency viewing of television did not contribute to transportation.

The previously discussed work indicates a strong correlation between Cultivation Theory and the concept of transportation. Specifically, the research suggests that people are more likely to be transported into narratives that reflect genres of which they are already fans. Consequently, someone who is a fan of soap operas is more likely to be transported into the narratives that are born from that genre than those who are not. Soap opera fans are more likely to support the promoted “truths” of the soap genre than nonfans. Additionally, logic would suggest that soap opera fans are more likely to make time to watch soap opera programs regularly than nonfans. Therefore one may hypothesize that, the more transported a person, the more likely he or she is cultivated; conversely, the more cultivated a person is the more likely he or she is to be further transported.
Entertainment-Education  

Entertainment-Education (also identified as E-E, EE, and Edutainment in literature) is a strategy where rhetors consciously incorporate educational material into mediated texts (e.g., television, radio, film, and video games) that are theoretically entertaining with the intention of changing societal attitudes and choices. The 1951 radio show, *The Archers*, and the 1969 television show, *Simplemente Maria*, were the first recognizable EE media interventions (Singhal and Rogers, 2002). Since then, scholars have established the positive outcomes of EE approaches to informing sizeable populations around the world (Kineaid et al., 1993; Singhal and Rogers, 2004; Ruland, Starren, and Vatne, 2008). EE provides a medium that can comfortably approach and discuss societal taboo topics (Slater & Rouner, 2002). These topics range from family planning and sexually transmitted disease (STD) prevention (Moyer-Gusé, Mahood, and Brookes, 2011), to messages concerning disease management (Aoki et al., 2004; Kennedy et al., 2004; Rudland, Starren, and Vatne, 2008; Ghosh, 2012), and includes drug and alcohol use (Borzekowski, 1996; Randolph and Viswanath, 2004; Guttman, Gesser-Edelsburg, and Israelashvili, 2008).

EE may be incorporated into commercially produced media as part of a larger body of entertainment programing (Moyer-Gusé and Nabi, 2010; Moyer-Gusé, Mahood, and Brookes, 2011). Many dramas and situation comedies (i.e., sitcoms) in the United States and abroad have presented specific episodes within a season where various society-wide issues are addressed by one or more of the characters. Much research has focused on sitcoms specifically for the effectiveness of the educational messages imbedded in their programing (Borzekowski, 1996; Singhal, Cody, Rogers, and Sabido, 2004; Collins et al., 2003).

EE researchers have investigated the use of narrative as persuasion (Moyer-Gusé and Nabi, 2010), the effect of humor on persuasion (Moyer-Gusé, Mahood, and Brookes, 2011),
and they have a developed models to explain the mechanisms (Slater and Rouner, 2002).

Some researchers believe that the concept of transportation could explain and enrich the societal outreach of Edutainment (Brodie, et al., 2001; Moyer-Gusé, 2008; Murphy, Frank, Moran, and Pantnoe-Woodley 2011; Quintero-Johnson, Harrison, and Quick, 2013). Not surprisingly, research has generally found that EE works for some of the public some of the time, and that different contexts and implementation strategies work for different audiences. For example, Moyer-Gusé, Mahood, and Brookes (2011) chose two episodes of the sitcom *Scrubs* in order to ascertain the affect that humor has on attitudes about unintended pregnancy. They found that (for male viewers in particular) the effectiveness of an EE message may be lessened by issue-related humor. However, they concluded that humor could be employed as part of the transmission of an EE message. They recommend that humor pertaining directly to messages be avoided because it “may trivialize a topic.” Rather, they proposed that humor be employed to serve as a “comedic backdrop” used to present a serious topic. Additionally, Guttman, Gesser-Edelsburg, and Israelashvili (2008) conducted research on the effectiveness of an antidrug abuse educational campaign in Israel. The researchers found that if the teen participants could not relate their lives to the stories portrayed in the sitcoms, that they had a hard time receiving the intended message. This data supports the notion that an audience-centered design is key to crafting an effective EE message.

Furthermore, the *Scrubs* study revealed that, generally speaking, college students preferred to receive commercially televised information about STDs rather than from newsmagazine formatted programming. However, participants who felt that they were at a high risk of being infected by an STD preferred their information to be delivered in a narrative drama mode (Moyer-Gusé, 2010). Moyer-Gusé conjectured that those who were
low risk felt that the newsmagazine format would be more factual. While those who perceived themselves at a higher risk preferred a more sympathetic format from which to receive information.

Some researchers suggest that unintended consequences of EE may negatively affect the overall message that rhetors intend to deliver (Singhal and Rogers, 2002). Research has been conducted to measure the effects that EE has on message delivery in a variety of contexts. Several scholars have concluded that a delicate balance exists between involving the “reader” in the message and insuring that the “reader” has received the information necessary to fully enlighten him or her of the intended message (Quintero-Johnson, Harrison, and Quick, 2013). Others suggest that sharing unintended information may be potentially harmful (Guttman, Gesser-Edelsburg, & Israelashvili, 2008). While still others are concerned that the style of which some messages are presented may persuade some “readers” to take part in the very activities that rhetors are trying to discourage (Rhodes & Ewoldsen, 2009).

These findings suggest that in order for EE to have the most impact, it is essential that rhetors develop a nuanced approach to message implementation. Messages must be tailored to specific target audiences in order to attain the highest positive outcome. Conducted research that matches the specific needs of target populations will allow EE rhetors to create high-impact, comprehensive programming. Matching the needs of a demographic is integral in developing a formula with maximum impact that reduces harmful consequences.

**Conclusion**

This chapter presented a literature review exploring and outlining music video inquiry, as well as examined the mainstream histories of punk and hip-hop. Post the
discussion of the punk and hip-hop musical genres and their effect on the public, the Cultivation Theory was described and the concept of transportation modes explained. Subsequently, research linking Cultivation Theory to the concept of transportation was discussed. Next, EE, was defined, past applications of EE were outlined. Finally, an argument for a nuanced approach to EE was made. This chapter also presented a historical and theoretical validation for how transportation modes provide a deeper understanding of music video messages and how that understanding is necessary to create more effective EE.

Music videos provide cinematic occasions to further the rhetorical vision of music message rhetors, and they allow viewers to become voyeurs in a fantasy world. These worlds may be symbolic or realistic or both. The fantasies presented in these worlds can reaffirm cultural stereotypes or provide an opening to expand cultural understanding; they present an opportunity to constructively and ethically educate viewers. Developing a further understanding of how vehicles of message narrations operate and cultivate may help future researchers, educators, and rhetors produce richer texts.

The literature reviewed has provided the foundation for the research presented in this thesis. This study investigated the effects of viewing a video depicting realistic or symbolic violence within a relationship in order to explore the perceptions of definitions of ambiguous relational behaviors. The research shows that males and females are likely to perceive these behaviors differently, which led to this research inquiry. The hypotheses and research questions are provided below.
Hypothesis and Research Questions

**H1:** Male participants will be less likely to define ambiguous relational behaviors as more abusive than female participants.

**RQ1:** Do male and female viewers differ in the extent to which videos containing realistic and symbolic portrayals are transporting and enjoyable?

**RQ2:** Does viewing realistic or symbolic portrayals of IPV in a music video affect perceptions of IPV?

**RQ3:** Do the music video stimuli that present coherent presentations (e.g., audio and visual fidelity) affect the way a participant perceives Intimate Partner Violence differently than presentations that have a less coherent message (e.g., audio and visual infidelity)?

**RQ4:** Will enjoyment of and transportation into the video affect definitions of IPV?
Chapter Four
Method

The following chapter will cover the method for the experiment portion of this thesis. The data collected for this study was collected over the course of one summer session and one fall semester at two different urban Midwestern universities. The demographics of the participants and measures that were used are presented in the following data.

Participants

Participants were recruited from basic communication courses at two large Midwestern universities. A total of 153 participants were recruited. Fifty-three percent of participants identified themselves as female, 47% as male, one person declined to indicate their sex. Participants’ ages ranged from 17 to 43, with a median age of 20. Seven participants declined to indicate their age. Sixty-eight percent of participants self-identified as white/Caucasian, 4% as African American, 6% as Hispanic, and 8% as Asian/Pacific Islander. Thirteen percent indicated “other” or decline to indicate a race or ethnicity. Participants received course credit for their participation. Responses were examined to ensure that participants were responding thoughtfully. Data from 10 participants was deleted due to “flat line” responding, i.e., using the same key to respond to long strings of questions. The demographic information was collected in the demographic measure which is presented in Appendix # 3.
Research Design and Stimuli

The design is a 2(video channel) x 2(audio channel) factorial design with an external control group that viewed a test pattern and heard white noise for three minutes. The video channel played either the video produced by the artist Eminem for the release of his song “Love the Way you Lie” or the video produced by Florence Welch for the release of their song “Kiss with a Fist”. The video was accompanied either by Eminem’s song “Love the Way you Lie”, or by Florence and the Machine’s “Kiss with a Fist”. Thus, in two conditions, the original music videos as produced by the musicians were played, in the other two versions the music from one song was dubbed over the video produced for the other. Figure five below depicts the conditions.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kiss With a Fist (Audio)</th>
<th>Love the Way You Lie (Audio)</th>
<th>Control Audio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kiss With a Fist Music Video (Visual)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love the Way You Lie (Visual)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Visual</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter Two provides a thorough description of these two conflicting message styles that seemingly address the same topic of Intimate Partner Violence. However, it is important to note again that the artists’ intentions differ greatly. While “Love the Way You Lie” was produced to depict an anti-domestic violence message, “Kiss with a Fist” was not
intended to be a message about domestic violence; rather it is about an emotionally volatile relationship.

**Procedure**

When they arrived at a computer lab located on campus, the participants were given informed consent documents and instructions pertaining to how to proceed with the study. Their names and section numbers were recorded so that they could receive credit for participation; this information was kept separate from the data collected. Headphones were provided to participants, so that they could hear the audio. However, participants were free to use their own headphones or ear buds.

Participants then selected a computer terminal in which to participate in the study. Each computer was equipped with access to Qualtrics, an online survey instrument. Qualtrics randomized participants’ condition assignments, as well as collected and recorded data.

Once seated, students were given general verbal directions for the study. Each assessment within Qualtrics included specific directions. Participants continued through each step of the study at an individual pace.

Participants were randomly assigned one of the five conditions described above. (Other measures were implemented but supplied statically insignificant results. Therefore, those measures will not be provided in this thesis.) The “Transportation Measure” (Appendix # 4) was next provided. The “Definition Measure” (Appendix # 5) followed. Participants were then asked about their experience with IPV through the “Experience Measure” (Appendix # 6). A “Message Evaluation Measure” (Appendix # 7) was given to the participants afterward. Finally, demographic information was solicited. A description of
each of these measurements along with the questionnaires is provided in the next section. A full list of instruments used for data collection are provided in the individual appendices.

**Measures**

**Transportation**

This measure was adapted from Green and Brock (2000) which was outlined in Chapter Three. The 17 items included in this assessment are designed to measure the extent to which message recipients are drawn into the narrative world of a message. In this case, the messages were the four video messages and the control. Responses were recorded on a -3 to 3 (strongly disagree to strongly agree) scale. Five items were written in the reverse direction, these were reverse coded. These items formed a reliable scale (Cronbach’s alpha = .85). Responses were averaged to form the measure of transportation.

**Message Enjoyment**

Message enjoyment was constructed from a subset of the message assessment questions asked after message exposure. This scale was subjected to a principal components analysis with varimax rotation to uncover underlying dimensions. The first factor to emerge was the message enjoyment dimension, which accounted for 37% of the variance and had an eigenvalue of 2.98. These items form a reliable scale (α=.84). Responses to these four items were averaged to form a measure of message enjoyment.

**Definition Measure**

Definitions of relational behaviors as abusive analyzed with an eight item measurement that represented a range of relational behaviors that fit the definition of warning signs of abuse, as described on the Center for Relational Abuse Awareness’s website (Center for Relational Awareness). The questions were created from the inventories
included in the *Intimate Partner Violence and Sexual Violence Victimization Assessment Instruments for use in Healthcare Settings: Version 1* (CDC, 2007). Participants were asked to rate how abusive these behaviors were on a -3 (not at all abusive) to 3 (extremely abusive) scale. Items that represent an ambiguous level of abusiveness were used in the present research because ambiguous behaviors were more likely to be affected by media models of abusive behavior. Examples of these items were, 1) your partner telling you that your clothes make you look like a slut/or ugly; 2) a partner takes money from your purse/wallet without telling/asking you; 3) your partner attempts to make you feel guilty that you are leaving him or her to visit friends or family. These items formed a reliable scale (Chronbach’s alpha = .81). Responses were averaged to form measures relating to the perceptions of abuse.

**Experience Measure**

The participants were asked five questions in order to determine their experience with IPV. Questions were modified from questionnaires collected by the CDC. These questions contained physical, emotional, and isolation examples. All questions were introduced with the phrase, “Have you or someone close to you…”

**Demographic Data Collection**

Finally, the participants were asked to provide basic demographic and background information. They were asked about their familiarity with the artists and the musical pieces selected for this study.
Chapter Five

Results

The following chapter will offer the results found during this study of IPV perceptions through the exposure of participants to music video stimuli. First, descriptive data will be presented. Second, the differences in responses based on the participant’s gender will be addressed. Third, the data relating to transportation and enjoyment will be presented. Finally, the correlations among reported enjoyment of the stimuli, reported transportation, and views of IPV will be presented.

Experience with IPV

In response to the experience with IPV questions, we found that over a third of our respondents had experience or knew someone who had experience with IPV. Almost 30% of the participants (29.6%) reported knowing someone at the time of the study who the participant felt was being treated badly by a partner. Forty-five percent reported knowing a loved one who was prevented from leaving his/her house, getting a job, going to school, or seeing family members by a partner. When asked, “Has someone important to you had personal items they have cared about destroyed by a partner?” 36% of the respondents said yes. Finally, 11.8% of the respondents reported knowing someone who was hospitalized by a partner.

In order to determine if previous experience varied by sex, a chi square analysis was conducted. The findings concluded that 59.3% of women reported having prior experience with IPV; in contrast, 31.4% of men reported such experiences, \( \chi^2(1) = 11.70 \ p < .001 \).

Sex Differences in Perceptions and Effects

Research questions one, three A, and three B involve gender differences in perceptions and effects of media. I first analyzed to see if sex of participant affected
perceptions of IPV. Because prior experience with abuse varied by the participant’s sex, I conducted a one-way analysis of variance on perceptions of ambiguous behaviors using prior experience with IPV as the covariant. This analysis revealed a significant effect of sex, $F(1,151) = 18.75, p < .001, \eta^2 = .11$. Inspections of the means demonstrated that women ($M=6.02, SD = .69$) interpreted ambiguous relational behaviors (e.g., partner steals money from subject, keeps subject from family, or insults the subject) as more abusive than men ($M=5.38, SD = 1.02$). In this analysis there was no significant effect of the covariant, experience IPV $p = .68$. Because variable did not affect perceptions, it was dropped from further analyses.

To determine whether this effect was specific to a particular video condition, a 2 (sex: male, female) x 3 (video condition: Florence, Eminem, control) ANOVA was conducted on the ratings of the ambiguous relational behaviors. Echoing the analysis reported above, there was a significant effect dependent on the participant’s sex, $F(1,146)=26.17, p<.001, \eta^2 = .15$. The results demonstrated again that women rated these behaviors as more abusive than men. This effect was moderated by an interaction of the participant’s sex and video condition, $F(2, 146)=5.59, p=.005$. $\eta^2 = .07$.

**Stimulus Effects**

Post hoc tests using the Least Significant Difference (LSD) indicated that women showed a significant contrast effect when viewing the Eminem video, such that their ratings of the ambiguous behaviors were significantly lower ($M=5.7$) after viewing the Eminem video than after viewing the Florence video ($M=6.2; p=.008$). Ratings for the ambiguous behaviors were also significantly lower for women after viewing the Eminem video ($M=5.7$ than after viewing the control video ($M=6.14; p=.019$), supporting the argument that the
contrast of watching the realistic violence in the Eminem video reduced the ratings of the abusiveness of the ambiguous behaviors.

In contrast, this analysis revealed that men were less likely to perceive the ambiguous relational behaviors as abusive after viewing the Florence video (M=4.88) than after watching the Eminem video (M=5.55; p=.036) or the control video (M=5.53; p=.037). It is likely that this effect represents a contrast effect as well, because although the violence in the Florence video is not as realistic as the violence in the Eminem video, the Florence video depicts female-on-male violence. Thus, after viewing a video in which a woman breaks a plate over a man’s head, men appear less likely to define ambiguous relational behaviors as abusive.

A three-way analysis including sex, music, and video condition was conducted. No main effects or interactions involving music condition were found. Therefore in order to simplify, the music condition was not used in further analysis.

Additionally, t-tests were conducted comparing the control video to both the Eminem and Florence videos separately for men and women. When comparing the Florence condition to the control, I found that there were no significant effects on the definition of ambiguous behaviors for women t(54) = .35, p = .73 (M= 6.20, M = 6.14 for the Florence video and control conditions respectively). However there was a significant effect for men, t(41) = 2.09 p = .04, such that after viewing the Florence video, men rated the ambiguous behaviors as less abusive M= 4.88 than after viewing the control M= 5.54. When women saw the Eminem video they rated the relational ambiguous abusive behaviors as less abusive than women who viewed the control video only, M= 6.14, t(51) = 2.25 p = .03. No significant difference was found in men’s ratings of ambiguous abusive relational
behaviors, \( t(51) = .06 \ p = .96 \) (M= 5.52, M= 5.54 for the Eminem video and control videos respectively).

**Sex Differences in Enjoyment and Transportation**

Transportation and how it relates to enjoyment have been investigated in the past (Green, Brock, and Kaufman, 2004). In a study, Bilandzic and Busselle (2011) found that transportation predicted participant enjoyment. Sex differences in enjoyment and transportation were evaluated with t-tests. There was a significant sex difference in enjoyment of the presentation, \( t(150)=3.50, \ p<.001 \), such that men reported greater enjoyment of the videos overall (M=2.91) than women (M=2.27). There was no sex difference in reported transportation, \( t(150)=.63, \ p=.53 \).

**Enjoyment and Transportation as Mediators of Perceptions of IPV**

A mediated model was constructed using the PROCESS macro (Hayes, 2013) in SPSS. Using model number six (see Figure six), this analysis tested the process through which viewing the Eminem video might affect perceptions of IPV. In this analysis, the Eminem video condition was tested in comparison to the Florence video and control conditions combined. In this analysis, the dummy code for the Eminem video condition was the IV, and the definitions of the ambiguous behaviors were the DV. Transportation and enjoyment were entered as sequential mediators. This analysis demonstrated that the effect of viewing the video was mediated through transportation and enjoyment (indirect effect \( b= -.08, 95\%CI = -.1648,-.0338 \)), such that the Eminem video was more transporting. When viewers were more transported by the video, they were more likely to report enjoying it. Such analysis leads to perceptions that ambiguous behaviors are less abusive than when transportation and enjoyment are low. Because the Eminem video presents a narrative, it is more likely to affect perceptions through transportation than the Florence video and the
control conditions. The narrative format presented in the Eminem video effected participants' view of ambiguous IPV behaviors as less abusive than those who viewed the Florence video, and also those participants’ views who were part of the control group. Complete model results are available in Appendix # 8.

Figure six. Mediation of definitions of ambiguous behaviors as IPV by transportation and message enjoyment.
CHAPTER SIX
DISCUSSION

Summary of Results and Implications

This study sought to attain a greater understanding of persuasion through narrative. First, a rhetorical analysis was conducted. The rhetorical analysis identified fantasy themes represented in both original music video artifacts. The first theme reflects that “passionate acts equal love”, while the second theme reflects that “violence equals love.” The more passionate the act the more the love is depicted in the act. Therefore, violence equals passion and passion equals love, and the more one loves the more passionate or violent his or her acts become. Once this chain was converted into a cycle that reflected the cycle of abuse, the Symbolic Convergence Cycle of Intimate Partner Violence was formed. Next, a literature review was presented which supported the experiment. This experiment provided further evidence that realistic narrative presentations have a greater ability to shape perceptions than more abstract presentations. Additionally, the experiment provided data that revealed that even though two music videos can contain the same themes about IPV, the manner or style in which these videos are presented can affect how participants interpret the themes.

The results of this thesis strengthen the understanding that a well-crafted message (or narrative) is a powerful tool. In this experiment, the realistic narrative was more transporting and entertaining than the whimsical narrative containing bright images paired with a catchy tune. This study provides proof through experimentation and rhetorical investigation that changing perceptions slightly in one direction (in this case simplifying what is defined as IPV) can greatly affect the way society views itself and allows its members to behave. In addition, this thesis demonstrated through a critical analysis the underlying
messages of two music video artifacts, and it laid ground work through an experiment that provided further proof that transportation can serve as a vehicle to cultivate similar messages.

The critical analysis of this thesis focused primarily on the lyrics of the two music video artifacts presented and took a closer look at the narration agency (who is saying what when), with the “Lie” artifact being the more complex of the two. The experiment demonstrated that the way a story is told is vital to understanding Cultivation Theory. The “Kiss” piece had little effect on participant definitions of IPV. However, the visuals of “Lie” were vital to understanding the transportive power of the message. When the visual story was paired with either artists’ lyrics, it affected participant reaction to the definition portion of the study. Cultivation stands on the principle that societal attitudes can be shaped by the stories we are told within the media. Transportation shows us that the more realistic and compelling a story, the more effective it is as a tool.

Those who create all types of media should be aware of this phenomenon. Furthermore, those who are interested in using media to educate (e.g., Entertainment Educators) should consider the findings of this thesis vital when creating future media educational tools.

Those who focus on IPV educational media should note the findings about IPV based on the reported gender of the participant. Female participants were more likely than males to report knowing or being the victim of IPV. Females were also more aware than males of subtle abusive behaviors. However, when transported females were less likely to identify subtle abusive behaviors. This study not only provides evidence that attitudes about IPV can shift after a well-crafted narrative is presented, but it also provides a critical explanation of how it does.
Limitations

While this study provided valuable data, further work should be done. A second study with additional conditions could be conducted. The additional conditions would further isolate the audio and visual messages and provide a deeper understanding of the power of the visual messages. Figure seven, a condition chart is provided below with the new conditions added in red.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kiss With a Fist (Audio)</th>
<th>Love the Way You Lie (Audio)</th>
<th>Control Audio</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kiss With a Fist Music Video (Visual)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love the Way You Lie (Visual)</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Visual</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure seven: A Proposed condition chart

More data should be collected to see which of the factors in the “Kiss with a Fist” depiction of violence had a more mediating effect. The violent acts in “Kiss with a Fist” are depicted in an abstract environment. Additionally, the violent acts are perpetrated by a woman on what appears to be a “smaller and weaker” man, and the format of the musical genre may have mediated the effects as well. Could violence perpetrated by women in a punk musical format create different perceptions than violence perpetrated by women in a hip-hop musical format? Further investigation focusing on the effects of images of women committing violence should be explored.
The most significant drawback of this study is that it was mainly conducted by one scholar, myself. However, like many academic projects, this endeavor would have been further enriched by other perspectives. A thesis should be conducted in this manner. Even though I was guided by excellent scholars, a project that fully encompassed both perspectives would have enhanced the findings. If a project of this type is attempted in the future, it should ideally be led by three scholars: an expert in media experimental analysis, a seasoned academic critic, and someone who is comfortable in both arenas. All involved scholars should see the value of all perspectives, and the scholars should value a mixed methods approach to academic inquiry.

**Future Directions**

This study has provided data which can add to the body of work that has previously investigated the link between cultivation and transportation (McKinley, 2012; Bilandzic and Busselle, 2008). As discussed in Chapter Three, Cultivation Theory relies on the long term effects on participants who view different depictions of a particular value or “truth” in multiple video artifacts; transportation is used to describe the ability of narrative to draw viewers into a story in order to further to further cultivate societal fantasies about how true passionate love is depicted between intimate partners.

Once the elements in entertainment media that cultivate audiences are identified, those same elements can be employed in EE to educate and persuade audiences about topics that effect public health and societal issues. During the course of experimentation, it was found that realistic artifacts were more effective in shaping opinions of those who were transported. Future work should be conducted to see if those who were familiar and fans of a rhetor (in this case Eminem) are more transported into the fantasies presented in the presentation.
Closing Remarks Regarding a Mixed Methods Approach

The research presented in this study demonstrates that researching entertainment artifacts provides valuable data that can help shape the future direction of EE presentations. Identifying what does and what does not persuade in entertainment artifacts provides a basis for using entertainment for educational purposes. Even though the rhetors intentions differ for EE and for music videos, the effective persuasive techniques used in entertainment artifacts should be employed in EE.

This thesis provided an opportunity to explore the same subject (IPV’s depiction in media) from two different approaches. I choose to study two music videos that approached the topic of IPV in two completely different ways. I first completed a rhetorical analysis of both video artifacts using the theory of symbolic convergence and fantasy theme analysis. This analysis revealed that the depictions of IPV in these artifacts recoded actions in a way that romanticized IPV. I then conducted a study that revealed the more realistic portrayal (“Lie”) of IPV affected opinions of the definitions of IPV. Those who were exposed to the visual depictions were more likely to consider the grey behaviors as less abusive than those who were not exposed to that condition. Critical analysis in conjunction with experimentation provided a more complete explanation of how cultivation through transportation takes place in a mediated environment.

This thesis and its findings would not have been possible within other academic disciplines. The discipline of Communication Studies allows scholars to explore one subject (in this case IPV as depicted through musical video artifacts) from a wide range of perspectives. Why should we strive to solely strive understand a small piece of a phenomena well, when we have the opportunity and the tools to create an environment that can provide a deeper understanding of large complicated processes of the human experience? In order
for this academic utopia to exist, we as communication scholars have to reach out to those who study and understand differently than we do. A mixed methods approach to inquiry must become a standard in our field.
Appendix # 1

"Kiss with a Fist"

You hit me once
I hit you back
You gave a kick
I gave a slap
You smashed a plate
Over my head
Then I set fire to our bed

You hit me once
I hit you back
You gave a kick
I gave a slap
You smashed a plate
Over my head
Then I set fire to our bed

My black eye casts no shadow
Your red eye sees no blame
Your slaps don't stick
Your kicks don't hit
So we remain the same
Blood sticks, sweat drips
Break the lock if it don't fit

A kick in the teeth is good for some

A kiss with a fist is better than none

Whoa a kiss with a fist is better than none

Broke your jaw once before

I spilt your blood upon the floor

You broke my leg in return

So let's sit back and watch the bed burn

Blood sticks sweat drips

Break the lock if it don't fit

A kick in the teeth is good for some

A kiss with a fist is better than none

Whoa a kiss with a fist is better than none

You hit me once

I hit you back

You gave a kick

I gave a slap

You smashed a plate over my head

Then I set fire to our bed

You hit me once

I hit you back

You gave a kick
I gave a slap
You smashed a plate over my head
Then I set fire to our bed
Appendix # 2

"Love the Way You Lie"

(featuring. Rihanna)

[Intro - Rihanna:]

Just gonna stand there and watch me burn
But that's alright because I like the way it hurts
Just gonna stand there and hear me cry
But that's alright because I love the way you lie
I love the way you lie

[Verse - Eminem:]

I can't tell you what it really is
I can only tell you what it feels like
And right now there's a steel knife in my windpipe
I can't breathe but I still fight while I can fight
As long as the wrong feels right it's like I'm in flight
High off her love, drunk from her hate,
It's like I'm huffing paint and I love her the more I suffer, I suffocate
And right before I'm about to drown, she resuscitates me
She fucking hates me and I love it.

"Wait! Where you going?"
"I'm leaving you!"
"No you ain't. Come back."
We're running right back.
Here we go again

It's so insane cause when it's going good, it's going great
I'm Superman with the wind at his back, she's Lois Lane
But when it's bad it's awful, I feel so ashamed I snapped

Who's that dude?
"I don't even know his name."

I laid hands on her, I'll never stoop so low again

I guess I don't know my own strength

[Chorus - Rihanna:]
Just gonna stand there and watch me burn
But that's alright because I like the way it hurts
Just gonna stand there and hear me cry
But that's alright because I love the way you lie

I love the way you lie
I love the way you lie

[Verse - Eminem:]
You ever love somebody so much you can barely breathe when you're with 'em
You meet and neither one of you even know what hit 'em
Got that warm fuzzy feeling
Yeah, them chills you used to get 'em
Now you're getting fucking sick of looking at 'em
You swore you'd never hit 'em; never do nothing to hurt 'em
Now you're in each other's face spewing venom in your words when you spit them
You push, pull each other's hair, scratch, claw, bit 'em
Throw 'em down, pin 'em
So lost in the moments when you're in them
It's the rage that took over,
It controls you both
So they say you're best to go your separate ways
Guess that they don't know you 'cause today that was yesterday
Yesterday is over, it's a different day
Sound like broken records playing over but you promised her
Next time you show restraint
You don't get another chance
Life is no Nintendo game
But you lied again
Now you get to watch her leave out the window
Guess that's why they call it window pane

[Chorus - Rihanna:]
Just gonna stand there and watch me burn
But that's alright because I like the way it hurts
Just gonna stand there and hear me cry
But that's alright because I love the way you lie
I love the way you lie
I love the way you lie

[Verse - Eminem:]
Now I know we said things, did things that we didn't mean
And we fall back into the same patterns, same routine
But your temper's just as bad as mine is
You're the same as me
When it comes to love you're just as blinded
Baby, please come back
It wasn't you, baby it was me

Maybe our relationship isn't as crazy as it seems

Maybe that's what happens when a tornado meets a volcano

All I know is I love you too much to walk away though

Come inside, pick up your bags off the sidewalk

Don't you hear sincerity in my voice when I talk

Told you this is my fault

Look me in the eyeball

Next time I'm pissed, I'll aim my fist at the drywall

Next time? There won't be no next time!

I apologize even though I know its lies

I'm tired of the games I just want her back

I know I'm a liar

If she ever tries to fucking leave again

Im'a tie her to the bed and set this house on fire

I'm just gonna

[Outro - Rihanna:]

Just gonna stand there and watch me burn

But that's alright because I like the way it hurts

Just gonna stand there and hear me cry

But that's alright because I love the way you lie

I love the way you lie

I love the way you lie
Appendix # 3

Demographic Measure

Are you (Circle One)       Male                      Female

Are you:      African-American        Asian            Caucasian/White                 Hispanic
Other

Age:____________________

Year in School:
One                  Two                    Three                 Four

Other (please specify) _______________
Appendix # 4

Transportation Measure

1. While the presentation was playing, I felt involved in it.

   
   
   
   
   -3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3
   
   Strongly              Strongly
   Disagree                Agree

2. While the presentation was playing, activity going on in the room around me was on my mind.

   
   
   
   
   -3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3
   
   Strongly              Strongly
   Disagree                Agree

3. I could picture myself in the scene of the events depicted in the presentation.

   
   
   
   
   -3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3
   
   Strongly              Strongly
   Disagree                Agree

4. I was mentally involved in the presentation while it was playing.

   
   
   
   
   -3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3
   
   Strongly              Strongly
   Disagree                Agree

5. After the presentation was finished, I found it easy to put it out of my mind.

   
   
   
   
   -3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3
   
   Strongly              Strongly
   Disagree                Agree

6. I wanted to learn more about the events depicted in the scene.

   
   
   
   
   -3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3
7. The presentation affected me emotionally.

-3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3

Strongly              Strongly
Disagree                Agree

8. I found myself thinking of ways the presentation could have turned out differently.

-3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3

Strongly              Strongly
Disagree                Agree

9. I found my mind wandering while the presentation was playing.

-3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3

Strongly              Strongly
Disagree                Agree

10. The events in the presentation are relevant to my everyday life.

-3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3

Strongly              Strongly
Disagree                Agree

11. The events in the presentation have changed my life.

-3       -2       -1          0        1         2         3

Strongly              Strongly
Disagree                Agree
Appendix # 5

Definition Measure

Rate the following situations on the scale as not abusive at all (-3) to extremely abusive (3).

1. Receiving flowers from a partner.

   -3  -2  -1  0  1  2  3

   Not Abusive  Extremely
   At All       Abusive

2. Your partner telling you that your clothes make you look like a slut/or ugly.

   -3  -2  -1  0  1  2  3

   Not Abusive  Extremely
   At All       Abusive

3. Telling you that he or she will kill him or herself if you ever leave.

   -3  -2  -1  0  1  2  3

   Not Abusive  Extremely
   At All       Abusive

4. Telling you that he or she wants to kill you.

   -3  -2  -1  0  1  2  3

   Not Abusive  Extremely
   At All       Abusive

85
5. Cutting or burning or otherwise harming him or herself in front of you.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Abusive</td>
<td>Extremely Abusive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At All</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. Being told that you are beautiful/handsome by a partner.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Abusive</td>
<td>Extremely Abusive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At All</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. Threatening a family member of yours if you do not agree with him or her.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Abusive</td>
<td>Extremely Abusive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At All</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8. A partner takes money from your purse/wallet without telling/asking you.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Abusive</td>
<td>Extremely Abusive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At All</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. Being physically prevented from leaving the house.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Not Abusive</td>
<td>Extremely Abusive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At All</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
10. Your partner attempts to make you feel guilty that you are leaving him or her to visit friends or family.

-3  -2  -1  0  1  2  3

Not Abusive  Extremely Abusive
At All
Appendix # 6
Experience Measure

Has someone important to you ever been emotionally or physically abused by a partner?

YES   NO

Within the last year, has someone important to you been hit, slapped, kicked or otherwise physically hurt by a partner?

YES   NO

Within the last year, has someone important to you been forced to engage in sexual activities in which he or she was not comfortable in participating by a partner?

YES   NO

Has someone important to you been in a relationship in which they have been physically hurt or threatened by a partner?

YES   NO

Is someone important to you currently in a relationship in which he or she is treated badly?

YES   NO

Has someone important to you had personal items they have cared about destroyed by a partner?

YES   NO

Has someone important to you ever been prevented from leaving the house, seeing friends, getting a job, or continuing their education by a partner?

YES   NO
Is someone important to you ever been to the hospital because of injuries received during an argument with a partner?

YES  NO
Appendix # 7

Message Evaluation

Instructions: For each of the questions below, please indicate your reaction to the message by circling the answer that best corresponds to your judgment.

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed was positive:

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Strongly Disagree
Agree

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed was distorted:

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Strongly Disagree
Agree

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed was fun:

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Strongly Disagree
Agree

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed was uplifting:

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Strongly Disagree
Agree

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed made me want to dance:

<p>| | | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Strongly Disagree
Agree
Overall, I thought that the message that I observed was boring:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed was informative:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed was purely intended for entertainment purposes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall, I thought that the message that I observed depicted a real-life situation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The message made me feel happy:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The message made me feel good about my current or past relationships:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strongly Disagree</td>
<td>Strongly Agree</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**The message made me feel bad for the characters (or singers) I saw:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**I feel like this message represented a relationship that I have had in the past:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**The characters depicted in the message were realistic.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**People in real-life have relationship like that depicted in the message:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**The characters depicted in the message were realistic.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**This message was filled with metaphors. It has very little to do with reality.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>-3</th>
<th>-2</th>
<th>-1</th>
<th>0</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
The message depicted a relationship that I want.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Agree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Strongly Disagree
Agree

Strongly

Agree
Appendix # 8

Run MATRIX procedure:

*************** PROCESS Procedure for SPSS Release 2.13 ***************

Written by Andrew F. Hayes, Ph.D. www.afhayes.com

**************************************************************************

Model = 6
Y = newambig
X = emother
M1 = transpor
M2 = msgPos

Sample size
152

**************************************************************************

Outcome: transpor

Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>R</th>
<th>R-sq</th>
<th>MSE</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>df1</th>
<th>df2</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.3740</td>
<td>.1399</td>
<td>.6447</td>
<td>24.3968</td>
<td>1.0000</td>
<td>150.0000</td>
<td>.0000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>coeff</th>
<th>se</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>LLCI</th>
<th>ULCI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>constant</td>
<td>2.1659</td>
<td>.0807</td>
<td>26.8397</td>
<td>.0000</td>
<td>2.0065</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>emother</td>
<td>.6750</td>
<td>.1367</td>
<td>4.9393</td>
<td>.0000</td>
<td>.4050</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**************************************************************************

Outcome: msgPos

Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>R</th>
<th>R-sq</th>
<th>MSE</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>df1</th>
<th>df2</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.3521</td>
<td>.1240</td>
<td>1.1849</td>
<td>10.5424</td>
<td>2.0000</td>
<td>149.0000</td>
<td>.0001</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>coeff</th>
<th>se</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>LLCI</th>
<th>ULCI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>constant</td>
<td>1.7879</td>
<td>.2635</td>
<td>6.7845</td>
<td>.0000</td>
<td>1.2672</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>transpor</td>
<td>.4329</td>
<td>.1107</td>
<td>3.9111</td>
<td>.0001</td>
<td>.2142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>emother</td>
<td>-.7379</td>
<td>.1998</td>
<td>-3.6940</td>
<td>.0003</td>
<td>-1.1327</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**************************************************************************

Outcome: newambig
Model Summary

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>R</th>
<th>R-sq</th>
<th>MSE</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>df1</th>
<th>df2</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>.3328</td>
<td>.1107</td>
<td>.7731</td>
<td>6.1436</td>
<td>3.0000</td>
<td>148.0000</td>
<td>.0006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>coeff</th>
<th>se</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>LLCI</th>
<th>ULCI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>constant</td>
<td>.2435</td>
<td>26.1149</td>
<td>.0000</td>
<td>5.8789</td>
<td>6.8414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>transpor</td>
<td>.0939</td>
<td>.7739</td>
<td>.4402</td>
<td>-.1129</td>
<td>.2582</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>msgPos</td>
<td>.0662</td>
<td>-4.1125</td>
<td>.0001</td>
<td>-.4029</td>
<td>-.1414</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>emother</td>
<td>.0662</td>
<td>-4.1125</td>
<td>.0001</td>
<td>-.4029</td>
<td>-.1414</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Direct effect of X on Y

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>SE</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>p</th>
<th>LLCI</th>
<th>ULCI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-.3386</td>
<td>.1686</td>
<td>-2.0081</td>
<td>.0465</td>
<td>-.6717</td>
<td>-.0054</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Indirect effect(s) of X on Y

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Boot SE</th>
<th>BootLLCI</th>
<th>BootULCI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total:</td>
<td>.1704</td>
<td>.0985</td>
<td>.3780</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ind1:</td>
<td>.0491</td>
<td>.0747</td>
<td>.2023</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ind2:</td>
<td>-.0795</td>
<td>.0316</td>
<td>-.0338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ind3:</td>
<td>.2008</td>
<td>.0731</td>
<td>.3806</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Indirect effect key

Ind1: emother -> transpor -> newambig
Ind2: emother -> transpor -> msgPos -> newambig
Ind3: emother -> msgPos -> newambig

Analysis Notes and Warnings

Number of bootstrap samples for bias corrected bootstrap confidence intervals:
10000

Level of confidence for all confidence intervals in output:
95.00

NOTE: Some cases were deleted due to missing data. The number of such cases was:
1

----- END MATRIX -----
References


doi:10.1080/08838150802643795


doi:10.1177/1368430209102847


*COMPLEXMUSIC.* Retrieved from: 

http://www.complex.com/music/2012/10/the-30-biggest-criminal-trials-in-rap-history/foxy-brown


http://acharts.us/song/55808


http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uelHwf8o7_U&feature=s2l


Ernest Bormann’s Official Home Page (n.d.) Retrieved from:


Films with a domestic violence theme (n.d.) Retrieved from:

http://www.womensaid.org.uk/page.asp?section=00010001001300340001


Green M. C. (2004) Transportation into narrative worlds: The role of prior knowledge and perceived realism, *Discourse Processes*, 38(2) 247-266, DOI: 10.1207/s15326950dp3802_5


doi:10.1080/10410230801968070


Hanna, K. (n.d.) Projects: KathleenHanna.com Retrieved from:
http://www.kathleenhanna.com/projects/music/bikini-kill/


Hurley, J. (1994) Music video and the construction of gendered subjectivity (Or how being a music video junkie turned me into a feminist). Popular Music, Australia/New Zealand Issue 13(3) 327-338


*The Katie Couric Show* (2014, September 23) ABC.


https://services.online.missouri.edu/exec/data/courses/2277/public/lesson01/less
on01.aspx

http://top40.about.com/od/singles/gr/Eminem-Love-The-Way-You-Lie-
Featuring-Rihanna.htm

Lenahan, P. M. (2009) Intimate partner violence: What do movies have to teach us?
International Review of Psychiatry, 21(3) 189–199

American Country Music and British Punk. International Review of the Aesthetics and
Sociology of Music, 19(1) 35-51

Retrieved April 2011 from: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LJDGhj1RlI0

American Sociological Review, 57(1) 56-71

Mathers & Rihanna] On Recovery [CD] Effigy Studios and Vocal Production by Island
Def Jam Music

June 6, 2014 from: http://eightiesclub.tripod.com/id127.htm
McKinley, C. J. (2013) Reexamining the link between cultivation factors and viewer involvement: Investigating viewing amount as a catalyst for the transportation process. *Communication Studies, 64*(1) 66-85


Murphy, S. T. Frank, L. B., Moran, M. B. & Pantnoe-Woodley, P. (2011) Involved transported, or emotional? Exploring the determinants of change in knowledge,


http://www.nytimes.com/2009/10/29/arts/music/29bowery.html?_r=0


Selected movies with the theme 'Domestic Abuse'. (2014) retrieved from:


6 Domestic Violence Movies That Are Hard To Watch (2010) Screen Junkies. Retrieved from:
http://www.screenjunkies.com/movies/movie-lists/6-domestic-violence-movies-that-are-hard-to-watch/

Smith, S. L. (2005) From Dr. Dre to dismissed: Assessing violence, sex, and substance use on MTV. *Critical Studies in Media Communication* 22(1) 89-98


CURRICULUM VITAE

Desirae Sarah Masterson

EDUCATION

Master of Arts, Applied Communication
Indiana University, IUPUI Campus

Bachelor of Arts, Communication Studies
Indiana University, IUPUI Campus

CLASSES TAUGHT

COMM R110 Fundamentals of Speech Communication (3 credit hours) [IUPUI]

In this class I combined online lectures, class activities, speech giving practice and the course text (Fundamentals of Speech Communication First Ed.) to impart course material. This course instills students the fundamentals of public speaking knowledge. Students leave my R110 class with a greater confidence in themselves as public speakers, experience giving and receiving constructive criticism, and critical listening skills.

Themed Learning Community [IUPUI]

As a faculty member of the “Power of Story” themed learning community I worked with fellow faculty, a school librarian, and an academic advisor to provide a supportive learning environment for students enrolled in a block of three classes together. We met and coordinated our curriculums to enhance the others. The learning community team worked together to ensure that our students were supported in their first semester at a University.
COMM C105 Voice and Diction (3 credit hours) [IUPUI]

This class helps students improve their speaking ability through focusing the quality of their voices and their diction. The first half of the students learned the International Phonetic Alphabet. The second half of the semester the students applied what they learned by delivering a series of vocal performances and critiquing other’s vocal performances through a critique paper and keeping a journal. For this class, I used a combination of the previous instructor’s workbook Lyle Mayer *Voice and Articulation* text book. I designed modules that covered course material for students to complete at home. During class time, we practiced what we learned during the modules through group exercise and games.

Grammar (Indiana Business College, now Harrison College)

This class focused on the mastery of the basic parts of English grammar. Along with the text book I provided the class with lecture and activities in class and utilized free computer exercises. I assigned an in depth journal assignment. This assignment allowed students to practice the skills they were learning or reviewing in class, and gave me the opportunity to work with them one-on-one with their individual needs.

Psychology (Indiana Business College, now Harrison College)

This course introduced basic principles of psychology to students. Along with the text, I provided lecture and learning modules. In this class, students participated in a group project where they learned and then taught their classmates about a chapter from the book. The students also completed creative final projects where they applied basic psychology theories to themselves.
Public Speaking (Indiana Business College, now Harrison College)

In this course, students learned public speaking concepts from the *Fundamentals of Public Speaking* (Lucas). I lectured with Power Points that I adapted from Lucas and used in class exercises to relate concepts to students. We reinforced these concepts during class exercises. Students applied these concepts while they prepared and delivered four class speeches.

Composition (Indiana Business College, now Harrison College)

This course began with a brief review of grammar and ended with students producing a 10 page research paper. In addition to learning the components of research and composition, students kept weekly journals and turned those in at the end of the term.

Customer Service (Indiana Business College, now Harrison College)

In this course, students learned customer service theories. Then they conducted research on organizations whose customer service policies they admired. The students then presented their findings to their fellow classmates at the end of the term.

Communication in a Professional Setting (Indiana Business College, now Harrison College)

This was a career development class for Medical Assistants. In this class students learned about organizational communication within medical institutions. I supplemented the text that was written by Indiana Business College with sections of communication text and articles and an outside speaker who was professional in a hospital. In classes, students discussed text, the articles, and their experiences in their externships and jobs.
ASSESSMENT AND CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT

IUPUI Speaker’s Lab Training
During my interim term as coordinator of the IUPUI Speaker’s Lab, I wrote the IUPUI Speakers Lab handbook, motivated team of mentors to create supplementary materials for each of the R110 speech choices, and training materials for new mentors. We did this using the National Association of Communication Centers guidelines for training as we were working toward accreditation by it.

IUPUI Speaker’s Lab Assessment
I created and distributed a mentor and Speaker’s Lab assessment in the spring of 2011. Students were asked about their experiences at the Speaker’s Lab and their impressions of the Lab and its mentors.

Communication Skills Workshop

My group mates and I interviewed and assessed the needs of the client. The client was interested in strategies for dealing with situations involving conflict in workplace scenarios. We then created a workshop experience that focused on skills that would be used during vertical adversarial or difficult communication situations.

Communication Effectiveness Assessment
In the spring of 2013 I joined a group with four other graduate students to evaluate an Indianapolis area nonprofit’s communication effectiveness. We assessed an organization’s messaging practices as pertained to a specific campaign. One group conducted a content analysis of the organization’s printed material, website,
Facebook page, and Twitter account. My partner and I conducted a series of interviews and sent an online survey to stakeholders in order to obtain feedback on the organization’s effectiveness for transmitting information about its initiative.

RESEARCH

Presentation to the 2014 International Communication Association Conference

Presentation to the 2012 National Communication Association Conference

WORK HISTORY

IUPUI R110 Leadership- IUPUI Speech Night Coordinator
January 2015-Present

IUPUI Research Assistantship (Communication Studies)
(Assistantship) Fall 2011/Summer 2012

IUPUI Liberal Arts Associate Faculty Technical Assistant
August 2011-March 2012

IUPUI Speaker’s Lab, Indianapolis, IN

Nanny, Private Residence, Savannah, GA
March 2010-August 2010
Savannah Country Day School – Teacher One and Two-Year-Olds

October 2008- March 2010

Savannah Country Day School – Teacher One and Two-Year-Olds

October 2008- March 2010

Islands Ace Hardware and Rental (Savannah, GA) – Office and Human Resources Coordinator/ Inventory Coordinator

April 2008- October 2008

Nursefinders- Customer Service Representative, Indianapolis, IN

March 2006-April 2007

Aero Industries, Inc- Inside Sales- Gorilla Mud Flaps, Indianapolis, IN

October 2005- March 2006

INTERNSHIP

Walt Disney World – Attractions, Fantasyland, Toontown, Magic Kingdom

(Internship) January 2004 – August 2004

ORGANIZATIONAL MEMBERSHIP

National Communication Association

Member from 2011-Present

IUPUI Graduate Communication Club

Member 2010-January 2014

Treasurer 2011-2012

Classroom Civility Community of Practice

January 2015-Present
ATTENDED WORKSHOPS AND CERTIFICATES

Question Persuade Refer (QPR) Training, January 23 2015

Gateway to Graduation Information Literacy Workshop, October 3 2014

Themed Learning Course Curriculum Planning Retreat, March 28 2014