CHILD ABUSE PREVENTION BY HOME VISITORS: A STUDY OF OUTSTANDING HOME VISITORS USING MIXED METHODS

Jaylene Krieg Schaefer

Submitted to the faculty of the University Graduate School in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree Doctor of Philosophy in the School of Social Work, Indiana University

January 2010
Accepted by the Faculty of Indiana University, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

_____________________________
Margaret E. Adamek PhD, Chair

Doctoral Committee

_____________________________
Carol Hostetter PhD

_____________________________
Gail M. Folaron, PhD

December 12, 2009

_____________________________
Angela B. McBride, PhD
©2010

Jaylene Krieg Schaefer

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED
Acknowledgements

My greatest thanks to my Committee Chair, Margaret Adamek, whose unflagging patience, guidance, and attention to detail fortified this work. Margaret has read every word in this document numerous times and took the time to consider each carefully. Her daily life as an accomplished, hard working mom and professor served as an inspiration to me. Her unwavering support was key to my finishing this lengthy process.

I would like to thank each member of my committee, Dr.s Carol Hostetter, Gail Folaron, and Angela Barron McBride. How fortunate I am to get to work with a group of such talented, brilliant women. If even a tiny bit of your collective wisdom rubs off on me, I will be very lucky.

Finally, thank you to each person who always knew I would finish someday. You know who you are.
Abstract
Jaylene Krieg Schaefer

CHILD ABUSE PREVENTION BY HOME VISITORS: A STUDY OF OUTSTANDING HOME VISITORS USING MIXED METHODS

Child abuse remains a serious health problem in the U.S. Yet, there are preventative programs that can significantly improve the parenting experienced by very young children and result in lower incidence of maltreatment. Home visitation is the most prevalent and successful form of primary prevention. These programs are staffed by home visitors who empower parents and are the lynchpin of home visitation programs. What makes some home visitors excel at this work is the focus of this research.

A small, non-random, purposive sample of excellent home visitors and their administrators was used to learn about the personal characteristics of outstanding home visitors. The mixed methods design of this research included qualitative interviews, home visiting situational vignettes, and quantitative tests of personality attributes.

The results indicated that this group of outstanding home visitors possessed important similarities. First, the home visitors were effective at forming and maintaining empathic relationships. The variables that facilitate the formation of the therapeutic relationships between home visitor and client include: (a) “good enough empathy” (need not be extraordinarily empathic but at least averagely so), (b) positive regard (showing respect to the families and recognizing that the parent is the expert on their child), and (c) congruence. Secondly, the home visitors possessed self-awareness allowing for reflective
practice and forming and maintaining better client relationships. Thirdly, the excellent home visitors possessed an attitude of lifelong learning. Fourthly, the home visitors strongly believed in the ability of their clients to change. This was accomplished by focusing on client strengths. Finally, in order for the home visitors to assist parents in therapeutic change, they had a belief in and understanding of systems theory and the impact that the environment can or has had on those clients. Without an ecological approach, home visitors are likely to blame the families with which they work for their unfortunate situations such as poverty.

Each of the five characteristics can be taught and improved, but entrenched beliefs are less easily manipulated. The five characteristics are ordered with the first (effective at forming relationships) the most amenable to change and the last (an ecological approach) the least.

Margaret E. Adamek PhD, Chair
# Table of Contents

List of Tables x

List of Figures xi

Chapter 1: Introduction and the Social Problem: Child Abuse and Neglect
  Definitions of Terms 1
  Incidence of Child Maltreatment 3
  Impact of Child Maltreatment 5
    The Impact of Child Maltreatment on Brain Development 7
    The Impact of Child Maltreatment on Attachment 9
    Resiliency's Influence on the Impact of Child Maltreatment 11
  Risk Factors and Child Maltreatment 12
  A Better Definition 14

Chapter 2: Literature Review
  Prevention 17
  Prevention Types 19
  Home Visitation as Child Maltreatment Prevention 20
  Effectiveness of Home Visitation in Preventing Child Maltreatment 22
  Problems in Measuring the Prevention of Child Abuse 24
  Models of Home Visitation 28
    Dr. David Olds' Nurse Home Visitation Model 32
    Healthy Families America Home Visitation Model 33
  Paradigms and Application to Home Visitation 37
    Ontology 38
    Epistemology 39
    Methodology 41
    Purpose 44
  Feminism Theory in Home Visitation 51
    Feminist Standpoint Perspective 52
    The Value of all People 54
    Empowerment and Practice 54
    Research Within Context 58
  Research Question 59
Chapter 3: Research Methods
Rationale for Choice of Methods 63
Sampling Design 65
Data Collection 66
  Focused Interviews of Administrators 66
  Demographics of Home Visitors 67
  Open-ended Interviews of Home Visitors 69
  Vignettes 70
  Personality Scales 72
  The Balanced Emotional Empathy Scale 73
  Myers-Briggs Type Indicator 75
Pilot Testing 77
Data Analysis 77
  Validity Issues 79
  Credibility 79
  Transferability 80
Protection of Human Subjects 80
Lay Summary 81
Researcher Subjectivity 82

Chapter 4: Results 85
Data Reduction 85
  Administrator Interviews 85
  Home Visitor Interviews 86
    What did the home visitors think made them good at their job? 86
    What did the home visitors think was a good home visit? 89
    What attitudes, skills or knowledge did the home visitors feel someone going into the field should have? 89
  Situational Vignettes 93
  Personality Scales 99
Data Extension 101
  Bridging Codes 102
  Filling In 104
    Relationships 106
    Self-Awareness 115
    Life-Long Learning 119
    Strengths 121
    Ecological World View 127

Chapter 5: Conclusion 131
Key Findings 131
Limitations of the Study 132
Future Research 134
Implications for Policy 138
Implications for Practice 140
Appendices

The Full-Length (30-item) BEES 144
The Myers-Briggs Type Indicator Instrument 146

References 152

Curriculum Vitae
List of Tables

Table 1: Comparison of the Key Features of the Home Visitation Models of Dr. David Olds and Healthy Families America 29

Table 2: Comparison of Positivism and Post-Positivism 38

Table 3: Participant Demographics 69

Table 4: The Four Preferences of the MBTI 101
List of Figures

Figure 1: z-scores of Respondents on the Balanced Emotional Empathy Scale (using normative scores for females) 111

Figure 2: Personal Characteristics of Outstanding Home Visitors 136